

# OUTLINE

---

PREFACE .....	III
TABLE OF CASES .....	XIX
TABLE OF STATUTES .....	XXVII
TABLE OF RULES.....	XXIX

<b>Introduction.....</b>	<b>1</b>
--------------------------	----------

<b>Chapter I. Electronic Discovery: Types and Sources .....</b>	<b>11</b>
---	-----------

A. Types of Electronically Stored Information ....	11
1. Custodian v. Enterprise ESI.....	11
2. Program Data .....	12
3. Messaging Systems .....	13
4. Organization-Specific Applications .....	13
5. Generic Enterprise Applications .....	14
6. Databases.....	14
7. Websites .....	15
8. Intranet .....	15
9. Extranet .....	15
10. Metadata .....	16
11. Backup Data .....	16
12. Fragmented or Residual Data .....	18
B. How and Where Electronic Information Is Stored .....	18
1. Storage Schema .....	19
a. Custodian-Centric Data Storage .....	19
b. Virtual Workgroup-Centric Data Storage.....	19
c. Business Unit-Centric Data Storage...	20

d. Enterprise-Centric Data Storage.....	20
e. Third Party-Centric Data Storage.....	20
2. Accessibility of ESI.....	21
a. Local and Online Storage of ESI.....	21
b. Near-Line Storage of ESI.....	21
c. Offline Storage of ESI.....	22
C. Computer Forensics.....	22
1. Forensic Disk Images.....	23
2. Recovering Deleted Files.....	24

## **Chapter II. Preservation of Electronic**

<b>Information</b> .....	<b>27</b>
A. Amended Rule 26.....	27
B. Trigger of the Duty to Preserve.....	28
1. When Does the Duty to Preserve Arise?.....	28
2. How Should Parties Identify When the Duty to Preserve Has Been Triggered?...	29
a. Pre-Filing Communications Among Counsel.....	33
b. Pre-Filing Preservation Letters.....	34
c. Closely Related Proceedings.....	35
C. Scope of the Duty to Preserve: “Possession, Custody, or Control”.....	36
1. What Is Control?.....	36
a. The Practical Ability Test.....	37
b. Functional Control.....	38
c. Party and Nonparty Data Stores.....	40
d. Parent, Subsidiary, and Affiliate Corporations.....	42
e. Control Imposed by Law.....	44
f. Control Based on Agency.....	45
g. Outside Directors.....	46

2.	What Is Possession? .....	46
a.	Access Alone Does Not Equal Possession .....	48
b.	Possession Does Not Require Ownership .....	49
D.	Bring Your Own Device (“BYOD”) .....	50
	Bring Your Own Device—Policy and Rules of Behavior .....	51
E.	Cloud Computing and Social Media .....	58
F.	Accessible/Not Reasonably Accessible ESI .....	61
1.	What ESI Must Be Preserved? .....	62
2.	Does Downgrading ESI from an Accessible to an Inaccessible Format Violate the Preservation Duty? .....	64
3.	Does the Duty to Preserve Include Metadata Embedded in ESI? .....	66
4.	Does the Scope of the Duty to Preserve Include Relevant but Ephemeral Data? .....	69
G.	Proportionality in the Preservation Context .....	71
H.	Implementing the Duty to Preserve .....	74
1.	Litigation Holds/Monitoring .....	74
2.	What Should an Organization Do After the Duty to Preserve Arises? .....	77
3.	How to Preserve Relevant Data? .....	78
4.	Lifting Litigation Holds .....	83
5.	Records Retention Policies and Information Governance .....	83
I.	Preservation Orders .....	88
J.	Obligation of Nonparties to Preserve ESI .....	90
1.	Privacy and Preservation .....	92

2. Preservation Obligations Under State and Federal Law ..... 94

### **Chapter III. Meet and Confer (Rule 26(f)) and Initial Scheduling Conference**

<b>(Rule 16)</b> .....	<b>97</b>
A. The Rule 26(f) Conference.....	97
1. Preservation of Evidence.....	100
2. Discovery or Disclosure of ESI.....	103
3. Form of Production .....	105
4. Retrieving Privileged Information .....	105
5. Duty to Cooperate.....	105
B. The Rule 16 Conference .....	108
C. The Interplay Between Rule 26(f) and Rule 16 .....	108
D. The Results of Failing to Cooperate at the 26(f) Conference.....	110
E. Local Rules or Court Guidelines.....	113

### **Chapter IV. Collection of ESI** ..... **115**

A. Searching All Appropriate Sources .....	115
B. “Custodian-Based Collection” .....	119
C. The Role of Outside Counsel.....	125
D. Forensic Collection .....	129
E. Collecting Data from Nonparty Hosts.....	131
1. Websites and Social Media .....	131
2. Mobile Devices .....	137
3. Cloud Computing.....	138
F. Data Collection Checklist .....	139
1. Initial Steps .....	140
2. Investigating Custodians .....	141
3. Investigating the Hardware Environment .....	144

4.	Investigating Backup Systems and Archives.....	145
5.	Investigating Applications and Databases.....	146
6.	Investigating Electronic Communication Systems.....	148
<b>Chapter V. Search and Review of ESI.....</b>		<b>151</b>
A.	Search Methods .....	151
B.	Use of Technology for Search and Review ....	157
C.	Technology-Assisted Review (“TAR”).....	166
1.	What Is It and How Does It Work? .....	166
2.	Have the Courts Accepted TAR as a Search Methodology?.....	170
3.	Can Responding Parties Be Required to Use TAR?.....	175
4.	How Involved Should the Court Get in the TAR Process?.....	179
D.	Negotiation and Agreement on Search Protocols.....	184
E.	Validation of Search Efforts .....	195
<b>Chapter VI. Production of ESI .....</b>		<b>199</b>
A.	Rule 34 Form of Production (Paper, Images, Native, or Other Forms).....	201
B.	Rule 34 Organization of Production.....	209
C.	Production of Metadata.....	214
D.	Production of Databases .....	222
E.	Production of Digital Images and Load Files.....	224
F.	On-Site Inspection and Mirror Images .....	227

G.	Discovery from Rule 30(b)(6) Witness with Knowledge of Document Retention and Production .....	233
H.	Production from Nonparties Pursuant to Rule 45 .....	239
	1. Relief from Undue Burden or Expense .....	241
	2. Nonparty Preservation Duties .....	242
	3. Subpoenas of Internet Service Providers (“ISPs”) .....	243
	4. Legal Restrictions on Disclosure .....	244
I.	Cross-Border Production Issues .....	245
	1. The <i>Aérospatiale</i> Framework .....	245
	2. Privacy and Data Protection Laws .....	249
	3. Foreign Discovery in the United States .....	251
	4. The Sedona International Framework and Principles .....	253

<b>Chapter VII. Challenges to—and Costs of—</b>		
	<b>Ediscovery .....</b>	<b>257</b>
A.	Challenging and Defending Ediscovery Process .....	257
	1. Standard of Reasonableness .....	258
	2. Challenges to Ediscovery Process .....	260
	3. Defending Ediscovery Process .....	263
	4. Informal Resolution of Ediscovery Challenges .....	266
B.	Costs, Cost Sharing, and Cost Shifting .....	268
	1. The Costs of Ediscovery .....	268
	2. Approaches to Cost Reduction .....	272
	3. Cost Sharing and Cost Shifting: The <i>Zubulake</i> Factors .....	274

4.	Factors in Addition to <i>Zubulake</i> .....	280
5.	Shifting the Costs Incurred by Nonparties Responding to Rule 45 Subpoenas .....	284
6.	Recovering Ediscovery Costs as a Prevailing Party.....	288

**Chapter VIII. Spoliation and Sanctions..... 295**

A.	Power of the Court to Sanction.....	295
1.	Rule 37 in General.....	295
2.	Inherent Authority .....	296
B.	Spoliation .....	297
1.	Definition and Elements .....	297
a.	Degree of Culpability.....	300
i.	<i>Residential Funding</i> .....	300
ii.	<i>Stevenson v. Union Pacific</i> .....	301
iii.	The Circuit Court Culpability Line-Up.....	302
b.	Degree of Prejudice.....	304
i.	Prejudice as a Necessary Element of Spoliation .....	305
ii.	Circumstantial Evidence of Prejudice.....	306
iii.	Standard of Proof Needed to Establish Prejudice.....	307
iv.	Presumption of Prejudice Based on Intentional Misconduct .....	308
2.	Rule 37(e)—General .....	308
a.	“Should Have Been Preserved in the Anticipation of Litigation” .....	309
b.	Decisions Discussing Duty to Preserve in the Context of Old Rule 37(e) .....	310

c. “Reasonable Steps to Preserve” .....	312
d. “Restored or Replaced Through Additional Discovery” .....	313
3. Rule 37(e)(1) .....	313
a. “Measures” .....	314
b. “No Greater than Necessary” .....	316
c. “Cure the Prejudice” .....	317
4. Rule 37(e)(2) .....	317
a. “Intent to Deprive Another Party of the Information’s Use in Litigation” .....	317
b. Default Judgment or Dismissal .....	318
c. Adverse Inference Jury Instruction .....	320
d. Who Is Subject to Sanctions? .....	323
<b>Chapter IX. Ethical Issues in Ediscovery .....</b>	<b>325</b>
A. The 2012 Amendments to the ABA Model Rules of Professional Responsibility .....	326
1. Duty of Technological Competence .....	326
2. Duty of Confidentiality .....	329
B. Respecting Rights of Third Parties— Inadvertent Production .....	330
C. Duty of Supervision .....	331
D. Duty of Candor .....	332
E. Duty of Fairness .....	334
1. Introduction .....	334
2. Electronic Discovery Search Terms .....	336
3. Litigation Hold Letters .....	337
4. Candor to the Court Regarding Vulnerabilities of Electronic Discovery .....	337
5. Metadata .....	338



- a. Ethical Concerns for the Producing Attorney..... 339
  - i. Attorney’s Duty to Maintain Client Confidences ..... 339
  - ii. Attorney’s Duties with Respect to Discovery ..... 341
- b. Ethical Concerns for the Receiving Attorney..... 343
  - i. Ethics Opinions Holding That Mining of Metadata Is Unethical..... 344
  - ii. Ethics Opinions Holding That Mining Metadata Is Ethical..... 345
  - iii. Hybrid Decisions..... 346
- F. Duty of Supervision..... 346
  - 1. Obligations of Counsel ..... 347
  - 2. Managing the Client Lawyer Relationship ..... 349
  - 3. Supervising Lawyers and Subordinates ..... 350
- G. The Sedona Conference® Cooperation Proclamation..... 351
- H. Ethical Issues in Discovery from Social Media Sources..... 354

**Chapter X. Electronic Discovery in**

**Criminal Cases ..... 361**

- A. Collection of ESI by Law Enforcement ..... 362
  - 1. Surveillance and Warrantless Searches of ESI..... 362
  - 2. Search and Seizure of ESI Pursuant to a Warrant..... 371

B.	Fifth Amendment Protections Against Self-Incrimination .....	374
C.	Preservation Obligation and Pre-Trial Discovery .....	376
1.	General Obligations of Disclosure Under Rule 16 and the Jencks Act .....	376
2.	Constitutional Duty to Provide Exculpatory and Impeachment Material Under <i>Brady</i> .....	379
3.	Trigger of the Duty to Preserve by the Government and the Defendant .....	380
4.	Management of ESI Leading up to Trial .....	384

**Chapter XI. Privilege Issues Arising During Electronic Discovery..... 391**

A.	The Risks of Waiver and the Costs of Pre-Production Privilege Review of Electronic Data .....	391
B.	Agreements Between the Parties to Control the Cost of Pre-Production Privilege Review of Electronic Data .....	397
C.	What Precautions Should Be Employed?.....	399
D.	Ethical Questions Involved in Receiving Mistakenly Disclosed Privileged Information .....	400

**Chapter XII. Admissibility of Digital Evidence..... 405**

A.	Introduction .....	405
B.	How Is Digital Evidence Used in Court? .....	406

C.	Which Evidentiary Rules Are Most Often Invoked When Digital Evidence Is Proffered? .....	408
D.	The General Approach to Digital Evidence .....	415
E.	Admissibility Requirements for Common Types of Digital Evidence .....	415
	1. Business and Public Records .....	415
	2. Machine-Generated Evidence .....	417
	3. Digital Demonstrative Evidence.....	418
	4. Digital Presentation to Illustrate an Expert’s Opinion or a Party’s Theory of the Case .....	419
	5. Pedagogical Devices.....	421
	6. Summary of Voluminous Evidence .....	421
	7. Digital Enhancements.....	422
	8. Internet Evidence .....	423
	a. Authentication of Internet Evidence .....	423
	b. Hearsay Issues with Respect to Internet Evidence .....	429
	9. Email Evidence .....	432
	a. Authentication of Email .....	432
	b. Hearsay Issues Concerning Email ...	436
	i. Hearsay Within Hearsay.....	437
	ii. Admission of Party Opponent .....	438
	iii. Non-Hearsay Uses .....	438
	10. Social Media and Chat Room Evidence .....	439
	a. Social Media .....	439
	b. Chat Room Evidence .....	443
	INDEX.....	447