
TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE.....	V
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS.....	IX
TABLE OF CASES.....	XXVII

PART 1. GOVERNMENT REGULATION

Chapter 1. FDA Control: Preliminaries	3
A. History and Overview	3
Peter Barton Hutt, <i>The Transformation of United States Food and Drug Law</i>	3
Lars Noah, <i>The Little Agency That Could (Act with Indifference to Constitutional and Statutory Strictures)</i>	5
Notes and Questions	7
B. Product Categories and Intended Use	8
1. Drugs.....	9
United States v. An Article of Drug . . . Bacto-Unidisk	9
United States v. Article of Drug . . . Ova II	15
Notes and Questions	18
Problem #1. The Battle Against Bad Breath.....	21
2. Dietary Supplements	22
Whitaker v. Thompson.....	23
Notes and Questions	25
United States v. Lane Labs-USA, Inc.....	27
Problem #2. Java Junkies.....	32
Notes and Questions	33
Nutraceutical Corp. v. von Eschenbach.....	35
Notes and Questions	38
3. Medical Devices	40
Alabama Tissue Center v. Sullivan	40
United States v. Bowen	42
United States v. An Undetermined Number of Unlabeled Cases	43
Notes and Questions	45
Sottera, Inc. v. FDA	50
Notes and Questions	56
4. New Drugs	58
United States v. 50 Boxes More or Less	58
Notes and Questions	62
5. Labeling	66
Kordel v. United States	66
United States v. Urbuteit	68
Notes and Questions	69
C. Adulteration, Misbranding, and the Practice of Medicine	70
United States v. An Article . . . Acu-dot	71
Notes and Questions	74
United States v. Evers.....	75

Notes and Questions	81
Retkwa v. Orentreich	83
United States v. Baxter Healthcare Corp.	85
Notes and Questions	89
D. FDA Practice and Procedures	93
Peter Barton Hutt, <i>The Transformation of United States Food and Drug Law</i>	93
1. Adjudication	95
United States v. Alcon Laboratories	95
Notes and Questions	99
United States v. Superpharm Corp.	100
United States v. Universal Management Services, Inc.	102
Notes and Questions	104
United States v. Dotterweich	108
Notes and Questions	111
2. Rulemaking	114
National Association of Pharmaceutical Mfrs. v. FDA	114
Notes and Questions	116
3. Informal Mechanisms	119
United States v. Bioclinical Systems, Inc.	119
Lars Noah, <i>Governance by the Backdoor: Administrative Law(lessness?) at the FDA</i>	120
Washington Legal Foundation v. Kessler	124
Lars Noah, <i>Administrative Arm-Twisting in the Shadow of Congressional Delegations of Authority</i>	129
Notes and Questions	134
E. Other Actors	135
1. Federal Agencies	135
American Pharmaceutical Association v. Weinberger	135
Notes and Questions	140
2. State Regulators	146
Dowhal v. SmithKline Beecham Consumer Healthcare	147
Committee of Dental Amalgam Mfrs. v. Stratton	152
Notes and Questions	154
Lars Noah, <i>State Affronts to Federal Primacy in the Licensure of Pharmaceutical Products</i>	157
Notes and Questions	166
3. International Networks	170
Richard A. Merrill, <i>The Importance and Challenges of “Mutual Recognition”</i>	170
FDA, <i>Global Engagement</i>	173
Notes and Questions	178
Chapter 2. Development and Testing of Experimental Therapies	181
A. Drug Discovery and Testing	181
FDA, <i>From Test Tube to Patient</i>	181
Notes and Questions	183

International Primate Protection League v. Institute for Behavioral Research.....	184
Notes and Questions	187
United States v. Palazzo.....	192
Notes and Questions	195
Femrite v. Abbott Northwestern Hospital	197
Notes and Questions	199
B. Supervising Research	200
Notes and Questions	202
Lars Noah, <i>Deputizing Institutional Review Boards to Police (Audit?) Biomedical Research</i>	203
Notes and Questions	211
Notes and Questions	213
Problem #3. When Does Treatment Become Research?	217
Abdullahi v. Pfizer, Inc.	217
Notes and Questions	226
C. Securing Informed Consent.....	228
Notes and Questions	229
Problem #4. Patient Protection and Protocol Design.....	230
Kus v. Sherman Hospital	231
Notes and Questions	235
Tivoli v. United States.....	236
Notes and Questions	241
Doe v. Rumsfeld	242
Notes and Questions	246
D. Access to Unapproved Products	251
Abigail Alliance for Better Access to Developmental Drugs v. von Eschenbach.....	251
Notes and Questions	262
Raich v. Gonzales.....	267
Notes and Questions	273
Suthers v. Amgen, Inc.	276
Notes and Questions	280
Chapter 3. Premarket Approval and Postmarket Surveillance	285
A. Pharmaceutical Products	285
1. New Drug Approval	285
Edison Pharmaceutical Co. v. FDA.....	285
SmithKline Corp. v. FDA.....	288
Notes and Questions	295
E.R. Squibb & Sons, Inc. v. Bowen	301
Notes and Questions	306
2. Generic Drugs and Bioequivalence Issues	311
Astellas Pharma US, Inc. v. FDA.....	311
Zeneca, Inc. v. Shalala	316
Notes and Questions	321
B. Medical Devices.....	325
Medtronic, Inc. v. Lohr	326
United States v. Caputo	328

	Ivy Sports Medicine, LLC v. Burwell	332
	Notes and Questions	340
	Contact Lens Manufacturers Association v. FDA	345
	Ethicon, Inc. v. FDA.....	349
	Notes and Questions	351
C.	Postmarket Surveillance and Response	354
	Nelson v. American Home Products Corp.	357
	United States v. Laerdal Manufacturing Corp.	358
	Notes and Questions	360
	Forsham v. Califano.....	365
	Notes and Questions	367
	Lars Noah, <i>Assisted Reproductive Technologies and the Pitfalls of Unregulated Biomedical Innovation</i>	374
	Notes and Questions	379
D.	The Perils of Poor Regulatory Advice	380
	Discussion Questions	384
	Stanton v. Astra Pharmaceutical Products, Inc.	389
	Florida Breckenridge, Inc. v. Solvay Pharmaceuticals	391
	Notes and Questions	398
	Chapter 4. Dissemination of Product Information.....	399
A.	Labeling	399
	1. Drawing the Line Between Rx and OTC	400
	United States v. Article of Drug . . . Decholin.....	400
	Problem #5. Fighting an OTC Switch Tooth and Nail.....	405
	Lars Noah, <i>Treat Yourself: Is Self-Medication the Prescription for What Ails American Health Care?</i>	406
	Notes and Questions	412
	Tummino v. Hamburg.....	415
	Notes and Questions	426
	2. Professional Labeling.....	432
	Bradley v. Weinberger	437
	Notes and Questions	439
	3. Patient Labeling.....	443
	Pharmaceutical Manufacturers Association v. FDA	443
	Henley v. FDA	450
	Notes and Questions	453
B.	Advertising	455
	1. Detailing and Continuing Medical Education Programs	456
	Christopher v. SmithKline Beecham Corp.	456
	Notes and Questions	462
	United States v. American College of Physicians	468
	Notes and Questions	470
	ONY, Inc. v. Cornerstone Therapeutics, Inc.	472
	Notes and Questions	476
	2. Direct-to-Consumer Advertising	478
	Notes and Questions	483
	Bober v. Glaxo Wellcome PLC.....	484
	Vess v. Ciba-Geigy Corp. USA	490

Notes and Questions 493

C. First Amendment Constraints 496

Thompson v. Western States Medical Center 496

Lars Noah, *Truth or Consequences?: Commercial Free Speech vs. Public Health Promotion (at the FDA)* 504

Problem #6. Stretching the First Amendment 510

Notes and Questions 510

Washington Legal Foundation v. Friedman 514

Notes and Questions 520

Lars Noah, *Permission to Speak Freely?* 524

Conant v. Walters 529

Notes and Questions 535

United States v. An Article . . . “Hubbard Electrometer” 537

Notes and Questions 543

Appendix: Package Insert for Capoten 547

PART 2. TORT LIABILITY

Chapter 5. Products Liability: Preliminaries.....557

A. Strict Liability and Unavoidably Unsafe Products..... 557

Brown v. Superior Court (Abbott Laboratories) 559

Grundberg v. Upjohn Co..... 564

Notes and Questions 569

B. The Relationship to Regulatory Standards 575

1. The Consequences of Noncompliance 576

Stanton v. Astra Pharmaceutical Products, Inc..... 576

Notes and Questions 579

2. Compliance and Federal Preemption 581

Lars Noah, *Rewarding Regulatory Compliance: The Pursuit of Symmetry in Products Liability* 582

Notes and Questions 591

Riegel v. Medtronic, Inc. 595

Notes and Questions 602

Problem #7. Preemption and Premarket Notification 605

Buckman v. Plaintiffs’ Legal Committee 606

Notes and Questions 610

Wyeth v. Levine..... 612

Notes and Questions 626

3. Tort Claims Against the FDA..... 631

Berkovitz v. United States 631

Problem #8. Passing the Buck..... 636

Notes and Questions 636

C. Causation Difficulties 637

1. Epidemiological Data 638

Daubert v. Merrell Dow Pharmaceuticals, Inc..... 638

Daubert v. Merrell Dow Pharmaceuticals, Inc..... 644

Problem #9. An Exercise in Epidemiology 650

Notes and Questions 651

Zuchowicz v. United States 655

	Notes and Questions	660
2.	Market Share Liability	664
	Hymowitz v. Eli Lilly & Co.....	664
	Notes and Questions	673
Chapter 6. Production Failures.....		677
A.	Manufacturing Defects	677
	Parkinson v. Guidant Corp.	677
	McCorvey v. Baxter Healthcare Corp.....	679
	Davenport v. Medtronic, Inc.....	681
	Notes and Questions	684
B.	Design Defects.....	687
1.	Settling on a Sensible Standard.....	687
	Hansen v. Baxter Healthcare Corp.....	687
	Notes and Questions	692
	Ezagui v. Dow Chemical Corp.....	695
	Problem #10. Combination Vaccines.....	697
	Notes and Questions	697
	Williams v. Ciba-Geigy Corp.	700
	Tobin v. Astra Pharmaceutical Products, Inc.	703
	Notes and Questions	708
	Lars Noah, <i>This Is Your Products Liability Restatement on Drugs</i>	711
	Notes and Questions	718
2.	Exempting Biomaterials Suppliers.....	720
	In re TMJ Implants Products Liability Litigation	720
	Notes and Questions	724
C.	Fear of Malfunction	727
	Willett v. Baxter International, Inc.	727
	Problem #11. Handling Y2K Paranoia	729
	Notes and Questions	730
	Bowling v. Pfizer, Inc.....	733
Chapter 7. Informational Defects.....		739
A.	Triggering the Duty to Warn	739
1.	Knowable and Unknowable Risks	739
	Vassallo v. Baxter Healthcare Corp.....	739
	Mack v. Stryker Corp.....	743
	Notes and Questions	746
	Feldman v. Lederle Laboratories	748
	Lars Noah, <i>Platitudes About "Product Stewardship" in Torts: Continuing Drug Research and Education</i>	754
	Notes and Questions	755
2.	Unintended Uses.....	759
	Proctor v. Davis	759
	Notes and Questions	770
3.	Generic Drugs.....	773
	Conte v. Wyeth, Inc.....	774
	Notes and Questions	778

B.	Scope of the Duty to Warn.....	780
1.	The Learned Intermediary Rule	780
	Larkin v. Pfizer, Inc.	780
	Notes and Questions	783
2.	Exceptions.....	786
	Edwards v. Basel Pharmaceuticals.....	788
	Perez v. Wyeth Laboratories Inc.	789
	Notes and Questions	798
	Lars Noah, <i>This Is Your Products Liability Restatement on Drugs</i>	800
3.	Other Sources of Information	802
	In re Factor VIII or IX Concentrate Blood Products Litigation	802
	Notes and Questions	805
C.	Measuring the Adequacy of Warnings.....	806
1.	Warning Health Professionals	806
	Felix v. Hoffmann-LaRoche, Inc.....	806
	Notes and Questions	809
	Bernhardt v. Pfizer, Inc.	813
	Notes and Questions	814
2.	Warning Patients	815
	Hahn v. Sterling Drug, Inc.	815
	Ramirez v. Plough, Inc.	818
	Problem #12. Pulling It All Together.....	824
	Notes and Questions	824
D.	A Duty to Design Better Access Restrictions?	827
	Lars Noah, <i>Platitudes About “Product Stewardship” in Torts: Continuing Drug Research and Education</i>	827
	Notes and Questions	828
Chapter 8. Utilization Errors and Medical Malpractice.....		831
A.	Liability of Users and Prescribers	832
	Magrine v. Krasnica.....	833
	Notes and Questions	836
	Kelley v. Associated Anesthesiologists, Inc.	839
	Tanuz v. Carlberg	841
	Notes and Questions	844
	Morlino v. Medical Center of Ocean County	846
B.	Liability of Suppliers and Dispensers	849
1.	Pharmacists.....	849
	Murphy v. E.R. Squibb & Sons, Inc.	849
	Notes and Questions	853
	Schaerrer v. Stewart’s Plaza Pharmacy, Inc.	855
	Morgan v. Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.....	858
	Notes and Questions	863
2.	Hospitals.....	865
	Cafazzo v. Central Medical Health Services, Inc.	865
	Parker v. St. Vincent Hospital	868
	Notes and Questions	870

Problem #13. The Malfunctioning Pacemaker	871
Chin v. St. Barnabas Medical Center	872
Notes and Questions	874

PART 3. ECONOMICS AND INNOVATION

Chapter 9. Pricing and Payment Systems.....	881
A. Insurance Coverage of Medical Technologies	882
1. Public Insurance Programs	882
Friedrich v. HHS	886
Goodman v. Sullivan.....	890
CMS, Notice, <i>Revised Process for Making Medicare National Coverage Determinations</i>	891
Notes and Questions	893
Weaver v. Reagen.....	897
Notes and Questions	900
Layzer v. Leavitt	902
Edmonds v. Levine	906
Notes and Questions	914
2. Private Payers	916
Sibley-Schreiber v. Oxford Health Plans, Inc.	916
Notes and Questions	918
Burwell v. Hobby Lobby Stores, Inc.....	921
Notes and Questions	933
3. Coverage for Experimental Treatments	936
Boldon v. Humana Insurance Co.	936
Jacobs v. Guardian Life Insurance Co.....	940
Notes and Questions	943
B. Technology Assessment and Pharmacoeconomics.....	945
Office of Technology Assessment, <i>Health Care Technology and Its Assessment in Eight Countries</i>	946
Paul C. Sorum, <i>Limiting Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation</i>	949
Notes and Questions	951
Problem #14. Preying on Parental Paranoia.....	957
Note, <i>Will Health Care Economic Information Lead to Therapeutic-Class Warfare or Welfare?</i>	958
Notes and Questions	962
C. Drug Pricing and Price Controls.....	964
Marie Salter, Comment, <i>Reference Pricing: An Effective Model for the U.S. Pharmaceutical Industry?</i>	964
Notes and Questions	965
1. Federal Efforts at Price Controls	969
TAP Pharmaceuticals v. HHS	969
Notes and Questions	972
2. State Efforts at Price Controls	977
Pharmaceutical Research & Mfrs. of Am. v. Thompson	977
Biotechnology Industry Organization v. District of Columbia....	982
Notes and Questions	987
Vermont v. Leavitt	990

Ouellette v. Mills	995
Notes and Questions	998
Pharmaceutical Care Mgmt. Ass'n v. Rowe	999
3. Private Efforts at Price Controls.....	1001
Joseph J. Hylak-Reinholtz & Jay R. Naftzger, <i>Is It Time to Shed a “Tier” for the Four-Tier Prescription Drug Formularies? Specialty Drug Tiers May Violate HIPAA’s Anti-Discrimination Provisions and Statutory Goals</i>	1001
Notes and Questions	1004
In re Brand Name Prescription Drugs Antitrust Litig.....	1007
Notes and Questions	1013
D. Supply Shortages	1014
Lars Noah, <i>Triage in the Nation’s Medicine Cabinet: The Puzzling Scarcity of Vaccines and Other Drugs</i>	1014
Notes and Questions	1018
Chapter 10. Managing Incentives for Innovation	1023
A. Intellectual Property Protections.....	1023
1. Patentable Subject Matter.....	1023
Mayo Collaborative Services v. Prometheus Laboratories, Inc.....	1023
Association for Molecular Pathology v. Myriad Genetics, Inc.....	1028
Notes and Questions	1032
2. Patent Prerequisites	1036
University of Rochester v. G.D. Searle & Co.....	1036
In re Brana	1041
Fujikawa v. Wattanasin	1045
Notes and Questions	1049
3. Types of Patents	1052
a. Composition Patents	1052
Sanofi-Synthelabo v. Apotex, Inc.	1052
Notes and Questions	1062
Zenith Laboratories, Inc. v. Bristol-Myers Squibb Co.	1063
Notes and Questions	1067
b. Method-of-Use Patents.....	1069
Eli Lilly & Co. v. Barr Laboratories, Inc.....	1069
Notes and Questions	1071
c. Process Patents.....	1074
Eli Lilly & Co. v. American Cyanamid Co.	1074
Bio-Technology General Corp. v. Genentech, Inc.....	1079
Notes and Questions	1082
4. Generic Drugs and Patent Extension	1086
Bayer AG v. Elan Pharmaceutical Research Corp.....	1086
Notes and Questions	1092
Photocure ASA v. Kappos	1095
Eli Lilly & Co. v. Medtronic, Inc.	1097
Notes and Questions	1100

5.	Copyright Protection	1102
	SmithKline Beecham v. Watson Pharmaceuticals, Inc.	1102
	Notes and Questions	1109
6.	Trademarks and Lanham Act Litigation	1109
	Eli Lilly & Co. v. Natural Answers, Inc.	1109
	Notes and Questions	1115
	Rhone-Poulenc Rorer Pharmaceuticals, Inc. v. Marion Merrell Dow, Inc.	1116
	Sandoz Pharmaceuticals Corp. v. Richardson-Vicks	1120
	Notes and Questions	1123
B.	Market Exclusivity Periods	1124
1.	New Drugs and Medical Devices	1125
	Upjohn Co. v. Kessler	1125
	Notes and Questions	1129
	Actavis Elizabeth LLC v. FDA	1132
2.	“Orphan” Products and Indications	1135
	Baker Norton Pharmaceuticals, Inc. v. FDA	1135
	Notes and Questions	1140
	National Pharmaceutical Alliance v. Henney	1143
	Notes and Questions	1145
3.	Generic Exclusivity	1147
	Purepac Pharmaceutical Co. v. Friedman	1147
	Mylan Pharmaceuticals, Inc. v. Henney	1150
	Notes and Questions	1154
C.	Competition and Antitrust Law	1158
	FTC v. Actavis, Inc.	1158
	Notes and Questions	1166
	Bristol-Myers Squibb Co. v. IVAX Corp.	1167
	Notes and Questions	1171
	Lars Noah, <i>Sham Petitioning as a Threat to the Integrity of the Regulatory Process</i>	1174
	MD Pharmaceutical, Inc. v. DEA	1179
	Notes and Questions	1181
	New York ex rel. Schneiderman v. Actavis PLC	1185
	Lars Noah, <i>Product Hopping 2.0: Getting the FDA to Yank Your Original License Beats Stacking Patents</i>	1190
	Notes and Questions	1193
Chapter 11. Evolving Medical Technologies		1197
A.	Overview: Defining Novel Technologies and Coping with Change	1197
	Lars Noah, <i>Managing Biotechnology’s [R]evolution: Has Guarded Enthusiasm Become Benign Neglect?</i>	1197
	Notes and Questions	1205
B.	Biologics and Human Tissue Products	1209
	United States v. Loran Medical Systems, Inc.	1209
	CareToLive v. von Eschenbach	1211
	Notes and Questions	1213

FDA, Final Rule, <i>Human Cells, Tissues, and Cellular and Tissue-Based Products; Establishment Registration and Listing</i>	1216
FDA, Final Rule, <i>Eligibility Determination for Donors of Human Cells, Tissues, and Cellular and Tissue-Based Products</i>	1220
FDA, Final Rule, <i>Current Good Tissue Practice for Human Cell, Tissue, and Cellular and Tissue-Based Product Establishments; Inspection and Enforcement</i>	1226
Notes and Questions	1230
1. Tissue Engineering and Stem Cells	1234
United States v. Regenerative Sciences, LLC	1234
Lars Noah, <i>Growing Organs in the Lab: Tissue Engineers Confront Institutional “Immune” Responses</i>	1238
Notes and Questions	1245
2. Cloning for Therapeutic and Reproductive Purposes	1250
Gregory J. Rokosz, <i>Human Cloning: Is the Reach of FDA Authority Too Far a Stretch?</i>	1250
Notes and Questions	1255
3. Xenotransplantation	1257
FDA, Guidance, <i>Source Animal, Product, Preclinical, and Clinical Issues Concerning the Use of Xenotransplantation Products in Humans</i>	1257
Notes and Questions	1260
C. The Genomics Revolution	1262
1. Genetic Testing	1263
Centers for Disease Control, Notice of Intent, <i>Genetic Testing Under the Clinical Laboratory Improvement Amendments</i>	1263
Michael J. Malinowski & Robin J.R. Blatt, <i>Commercialization of Genetic Testing Services: The FDA, Market Forces, and Biological Tarot Cards</i>	1266
Notes and Questions	1268
2. Therapeutic Applications	1272
Edward A. Marshall, Note, <i>Medical Malpractice in the New Eugenics: Relying on Innovative Tort Doctrine to Provide Relief When Gene Therapy Fails</i>	1272
Notes and Questions	1274
Problem #15. Hurdles to Customized Medicines	1280
D. Bioethical Challenges Posed by Technology	1280
Michael H. Shapiro, <i>Is Bioethics Broke?: On the Idea of Ethics and Law “Catching Up” with Technology</i>	1281
Notes and Questions	1287
1. Death and Technology	1290
In re Bowman	1290
Notes and Questions	1292
Lars Noah, <i>Turn the Beat Around?: Deactivating Implanted Cardiac-Assist Devices</i>	1294
2. Technology, Rationing, and Futility	1298
Mark A. Hall, <i>Rationing Health Care at the Bedside</i>	1299
Paul C. Sorum, <i>Limiting Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation</i>	1303

	Notes and Questions	1305
	Lars Noah, <i>Triage in the Nation's Medicine Cabinet: The Puzzling Scarcity of Vaccines and Other Drugs</i>	1306
	Notes and Questions	1308
3.	Defining Categories of Disease.....	1311
	Lars Noah, <i>Pigeonholing Illness: Medical Diagnosis as a Legal Construct</i>	1311
	Notes and Questions	1314
E.	Postscript: Defining Novel Technologies and Coping with Change	1319
	Sherley v. Sebelius.....	1319
	Lars Noah, <i>A Postmodernist Take on the Human Embryo Research Debate</i>	1326
	Notes and Questions	1335
	INDEX	1339