# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface to the Second Edition ................................................................. V
Preface to the First Edition ................................................................. VII
About the Author .................................................................................. IX
Reactions to the First Edition of Popper’s Materials on Tort Reform ................................................................. XI
Table of Cases ..................................................................................... XIX
Table of Authorities ............................................................................. XXI

An Introduction to the Text and to Tort Reform ................................. 1

Part I. Tort Reform Narratives and Essays ........................................ 9
A.  An Introduction to the Narrative and Essays—and More Tort Reform
Issues ........................................................................................................ 9
B.  The Essays ......................................................................................... 18
Group One: Tort Reform: Great Issues, Choices, and Political
    Challenges .......................................................................................... 18
    Victor E. Schwartz, The Dynamics of Tort Law: Its Capacity for
    Change—It Can Help or Harm Society ................................................. 20
    Erwin Chemerinsky, The Politics of Tort Reform .............................. 27
    Ronen Avraham, Tort Reform May Reduce Healthcare Costs, but
    It’s No Silver Bullet—So Let’s Think Outside of the Box ............ 29
    Neil Vidmar, Medical Malpractice Tort Reform .............................. 33
    Joan Vogel, The Tort Reform Movement as a Teaching Vehicle..... 35
    Todd J. Zywicki and Dr. Jeremy Kidd, Public Choice and Tort
    Reform .................................................................................................. 39
    Michael Rustad, The Endless Campaign: How the Tort Reformers
    Successfully and Incessantly Market Their Groupthink to the
    Rest of Us .............................................................................................. 42
    Stephen D. Sugarman, The Transformation of Tort Reform ....... 52
    Pamela Gilbert, The Human Face of Tort Reform ......................... 55
    Mark Behrens, Who Should Decide Tort Law? A Fundamental
    Issue in the Public Debate Over Civil Justice Reform .......... 59
    Frank J. Vandall, Tort Reform, A Power Play .............................. 61
    Jeffrey O’Connel and Christopher Robinette, Tort Law’s Flaws .... 64
    Carl T. Bogus, Introduction: Genuine Tort Reform ...................... 66
    George Priest, The Economic Case for Tort Reform ....................... 69
### Group Three: Tort Reform: A Personal, Public, and Institutional Discourse

- Paul Taylor, *Strengthening Democracy through Tort Reform* 83
- Sue Steinman, *Tort Reform: A Personal Reflection* 90
- Aaron D. Twerski, *Musings of a So-Called Tort Reformer* 92

### Group Four: Tort Reform: Justice Delayed, Denied, or Enhanced?

- Sherman Joyce, *New Issues in “Tort Reform”* 103
- Joanne Doroshow, *Access to Justice* 106
- Martha Chamallas, *Civil Rights and Civil Wrongs* 108
- Donald G. Gifford, *Tort Reform as a Two-Way Street* 111
- Richard L. Cupp, Jr., *Tort Reform or Tort Restriction: Rhetoric as Scorekeeper* 113
- Paul Figley, *Calls for Justice & “Joint and Several Liability”* 115
- Lucinda M. Finley, *What is Tort Reform Really About?* 117

### C. The Narratives

- **Narrative 1: The Restaurant, the Accident, Miranda and Simon Daine** 123
- **Narrative 2: Simon Daine** 125
- **Narrative 3: Richard and Simon, Through Miranda’s Eyes** 127
- **Narrative 4: Daine v. Armstrong Industries** 129
- **Narrative 5: Daine v. Armstrong Ends** 135
- **Narrative 6: Devon Armstrong, CEO, Armstrong Industries and the Birmingham Case Through the Eyes of Miranda Daine** 138
- **Narrative 7: Devon Armstrong and the Consequences of the Birmingham Trial** 140
- **Narrative 8: Senator Horace Voltman, Through the Eyes of Miranda Daine** 142
- **Narrative 9: A Tort Reform Hearing Through the Eyes of Miranda Daine** 144
- **Narrative 10: Marty Correll, Through the Eyes of Miranda Daine** 148
- **Narrative 11: Marty Correll’s Discussion with Senator Horace Voltman** 150
- **Narrative 12: Lunch with Marty Correll** 154

### Notes, Questions and a Simulation

- 155
# Table of Contents

Part II. Select Articles, Statements, and Related Materials from Academicians, Interest Groups, and Others .......................... 163

The Articles ...................................................................................................................... 164

A. A Brief Look at the Background and General Goals of Tort Reform .................. 164

Notes and Questions ....................................................................................................... 164

James A. Comodeca, Margaret M. Maggio, Philip J. Truax, and Joshua M. Bilz, Killing the Golden Goose by Evaluating Medical Care Through the Retroscope: Tort Reform from the Defense Perspective ........................................................................................................... 165

Christopher J. Roederer, Democracy and Tort Law in America: The Counter-Revolution ................................................................................................................ 167

Rachel M. Janutis, The Struggle Over Tort Reform and the Overlooked Legacy of the Progressives ........................................................................................................... 170

Julie Davies, Reforming the Tort Reform Agenda ....................................................... 175

F. Patrick Hubbard, The Nature and Impact of the “Tort Reform” Movement ................................................................................................................................. 178

B. Is the Civil Justice System in Crisis? The Basic Dispute and the Nature of the Fight ......................................................................................................................... 186

CJD Item I, “We The Plaintiffs”—A Retort ................................................................ 188

CJD Item II, Federal Preemption of Tort Law: No Recourse for the Injured; Immunity for the Wrongdoer .................................................................................... 193

CJD Item III, Glossary of “Tort Reforms” ................................................................... 196

Larry Lyon, Bradley J.B. Toben, James M. Underwood, William D. Underwood and James Wren, Straight from the Horse’s Mouth: Judicial Observations of Jury Behavior and the Need for Tort Reform ......................................................................................................................... 199

American Tort Reform Association: Commentary, Press Releases, and a White Paper ......................................................................................................................... 207

C. What Should Change—If Anything: the Content of the Tort Reform Discourse ............................................................................................................................ 224

Notes and Questions ....................................................................................................... 224

Congressional Budget Office, 2003, The Economics of U.S. Tort Liability: A Primer .............................................................................................................................. 225

Nancy C. Marcus, Phantom Parties and Other Practical Problems with the Attempted Abolition of Joint and Several Liability .......... 230

Victor E. Schwartz and Cary Silverman, The Case in Favor of Civil Justice Reform ................................................................................................................................. 232

D. Caps and Other Tort Reforms Disputes ................................................................. 245

Lee Harris and Jennifer Longo, Flexible Tort Reform ................................................ 245

Lee Harris, Tort Reform as a Carrot-and-Stick ............................................................ 251

Joanna M. Shepherd, Tort Reforms’ Winners and Losers: The Competing Effects of Care and Activity Levels ............................................................ 258

Richard C. Gross, Caps on Medical Malpractice Damages Cut Doctors’ Insurance Costs May 2007 .......................................................... 261

Center for Justice & Democracy, Snapshot of Justice 2008: “Caps” Do Not Cause Insurance Rates to Drop ........................ 262
The Honorable Richard Posner, United States Court of Appeals for the 7th Circuit Professor of Law, University of Chicago Law School, Posner on Tort Reform ................................................................. 264

Part III. A Very Brief Look at the Caselaw ........................................... 267
BMW of North America, Inc. v. Gore ....................................................... 268
Notes, Comments, and Questions .......................................................... 270
State Farm Mut. Auto. Ins. Co. v. Campbell ........................................... 271
Notes, Comments, and Questions .......................................................... 276
Wyeth v. Levine ....................................................................................... 277
Notes, Comments, and Questions .......................................................... 284
Oneok v. Learjet ....................................................................................... 286
Notes and Questions ................................................................................ 289
PLIVA, Inc. v. Mensing .............................................................................. 290
Notes and Questions ................................................................................ 293
Zeier v. Zimmer, Inc. ................................................................................ 294
Notes and Questions ................................................................................ 298
Murphy v. Russell ..................................................................................... 300
Notes and Questions ................................................................................ 301
Coleman v. Maxwell Shoe Company, Inc. ................................................. 303
Notes and Questions ................................................................................ 307

Conclusion ............................................................................................... 309

INDEX ...................................................................................................... 311