

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE	III
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	V
PERMISSIONS	VII
TABLE OF CASES	XXIII

PART I. PHILOSOPHIES OF LAW THROUGH THE CASES

Chapter One. Law, Justice, and the Problem of Taste: Arguments from (and About) Natural Law	3
Orientation	3
Traiton v. Traiton	4
Notes and Questions	5
Riggs v. Palmer	6
Notes and Questions	14
Rochin v. California	17
Notes and Questions	22
Readings	25
1. Natural Law Arguments in Politics and the Arts	25
Martin Luther King, Jr., Letter from a Birmingham Jail	25
Plato, Crito	28
Herman Melville, Billy Budd, Sailor	32
Martha C. Nussbaum, From Disgust to Humanity: Sexual Orientation and Constitutional Law	35
Notes and Questions	37
2. The Philosophical Argument from (or for) Natural Law	40
Thomas Hobbes, Leviathan	40
Aristotle, Rhetoric	42
Thomas Aquinas, Summa Theologica	42
Lon Fuller, The Morality of Law	53
Notes and Questions	56
John Finnis, Natural Law and Natural Rights	57
Notes and Questions	68
Chapter Two. Avoiding the Problem of “Taste” in Law: Legal Positivism	73
Orientation	73
A. Separating Law from Morality	76
Union Pac. Ry. Co. v. Cappier	76
Mills v. Wyman	79
Notes and Questions	81
United States v. Calley	81

Notes and Questions	89
B. Positivism and the Problem of Discretion in Interpreting and Applying a Rule	90
McBoyle v. United States.....	90
Notes and Questions	92
Readings.....	94
John Austin, The Province of Jurisprudence Determined.....	94
Notes and Questions	109
Hans Kelsen, General Theory of Law and State	110
Notes and Questions	121
H. L. A. Hart, The Concept of Law	122
Notes and Questions	137
Chapter Three. Scrapping Natural Law and Positivism: Legal Realism as a Strategy for Resisting Both Theology Lite and the Pretense of Determinacy	
	141
Orientation	141
Bush v. Gore	142
Sanford Levinson, Return of Legal Realism.....	163
Notes and Questions	165
Brown v. Board of Education.....	169
Herbert Wechsler, Toward Neutral Principles of Constitutional Law	174
Notes and Questions	176
Readings	179
Oliver Wendell Holmes, Path of the Law	179
Karl N. Llewellyn, Some Realism About Realism—Responding to Dean Pound.....	179
Jerome Frank, Law and the Modern Mind.....	186
Felix S. Cohen, Transcendental Nonsense and the Functional Approach	191
Joseph William Singer, Legal Realism Now.....	195
Thomas J. Miles & Cass R. Sunstein, The New Legal Realism	201
Notes and Questions	210
Chapter Four. Post-Realist Approaches to Law and Obligation (I): The Legal Process School and Contemporary Pragmatism	
	215
Orientation	215
A. The Legal Process Approach Described: “The Case of the Spoiled Cantaloupes”.....	221
Charles F. Sabel & William H. Simon, Contextualizing Regimes: Institutionalization as a Response to the Limits of Interpretation and Policy Engineering	222
B. The Legal Process Approach Exemplified: Statutes of Limitations and the Problem of Equal Pay for Women and Men	225
The Federal Statutory Background	225
The Administrative Process.....	227

The Supreme Court Speaks	228
Ledbetter v. Goodyear Tire & Rubber Co.	228
In the Media and in the Political Realm	245
Robert Pear, “Justices’ Ruling in Discrimination Case May Draw Quick Action by Obama”	245
Congress and the President Respond	247
One Part of the Aftermath	249
Alexander v. Seton Hall University	249
A Reality Check	257
Jacqueline A. Berrien, Chair, U.S. Equal Employment Opportunity Commission, Statement on Equal Pay Day	257
Notes and Questions	257
Readings.....	264
Michael Dorf, Legal Indeterminacy and Institutional Design	264
William Eskridge and Philip Frickey, eds., Hart and Sacks’ The Legal Process: Basic Problems in the Making and Application of Law	271
Are the Legal Process School and Its Contemporary Variants “Pragmatic?”	272
Richard A. Posner, What Has Pragmatism to Offer Law?	272
Notes and Questions	274
Chapter Five. Post-Realist Approaches to Law and Obligation	
(II): Law and Economics	277
Orientation	277
Tort Law: Negligence	279
United States v. Carroll Towing Co.	279
Tort Law: Strict Liability.....	281
Spano v. Perini Corporation et al.	281
Notes and Questions	285
Property Law	289
Ploof v. Putnam	289
Notes and Questions	291
Statutory Law: Antitrust.....	295
United States v. Syufy Enterprises.....	295
Notes and Questions	307
Readings	309
Adam Smith, The Theory of the Moral Sentiments	309
Ronald Coase, The Problem of Social Cost	311
Keith N. Hylton, Calabresi and the Intellectual History of Law and Economics.....	313
Thomas F. Cotter, Legal Pragmatism and the Law and Economics Movement.....	321
Louis Kaplow & Steven Shavell, Economic Analysis of Law	327
The Challenge of Behavioral Economics.....	329
Daniel H. Pink, Drive, The Surprising Truth about What Motivates Us.....	329

Christine Jolls, Cass R. Sunstein, and Richard Thaler, A Behavioral Approach to Law and Economics	330
Notes and Questions	343
Chapter Six. Post-Realist Approaches to Law and Obligation	
(III): Critical Legal Studies	349
Orientation	349
Critical Legal Studies and Contract Law	352
Coppage v. State of Kansas	352
Hoffman v. Red Owl Stores, Inc.	359
Notes and Questions	362
Jay M. Feinman & Peter Gabel, Contract Law as Ideology	362
Critical Legal Studies and the Public/Private Distinction	373
Hertzog v. Hertzog	373
Notes and Questions	378
Clare Dalton, An Essay in the Deconstruction of Contract Doctrine	378
Notes and Questions	389
Readings	390
Roberto Unger, The Critical Legal Studies Movement	390
Notes and Questions	407
Chapter Seven. Post-Realist Approaches to Law and Obligation	
(IV): Feminist Jurisprudence	413
Orientation	413
A. The Discrimination Template and Its Limitations	415
1. Gender and the Equal Protection Clause	415
Reed v. Reed	415
Craig v. Boren	418
J.E.B. v. Alabama ex rel. T.B.	421
Notes and Questions	428
2. Violence Against Women as Discrimination	429
United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women, General Recommendation 19: Violence against Women	430
A.T. v. Hungary	436
Notes and Questions	440
Chisun Lee, Counter ‘Revolution.’ FCC Dubs Feminist Lyrics ‘Patently Offensive’	443
B. Controlling Women’s Sexuality and Autonomy	445
State v. Smith	445
Notes and Questions	454
In re Fauziya Kasinga	454
Notes and Questions	463
Debran Rowland, The Boundaries of Her Body: The Troubling History of Women’s Rights in America 5	465
Gonzales v. Carhart	465

Readings.....	469
Nadine Taub and Elizabeth M. Schneider, Women’s Subordination and the Role of Law	469
Angela P. Harris, Race and Essentialism in Feminist Legal Theory.....	474
Notes and Questions	479
Chapter Eight. Post-Realist Approaches to Law and Obligation	
(VI): Critical Race Theory.....	481
Orientation	481
McCleskey v. Kemp	483
Notes and Questions	493
R.A.V. v. City of St. Paul, Minnesota	498
Mari Matsuda and Charles R. Lawrence III, Epilogue: Burning Crosses and the R.A.V. Case.....	507
Notes and Questions	510
Bishop v. Toys “R” Us.....	511
Patricia Williams, Spirit-Murdering the Messenger: The Discourse of Fingerprinting as the Law’s Response to Racism	519
Notes and Questions	521
Readings	524
W. Haywood Burns, Law and Race in Early America	524
Paul Butler, Racially Based Jury Nullification: Black Power in the Criminal Justice System	528
Notes and Questions	541
Richard Delgado & Jean Stefancic, Critical Perspectives on Police, Policing, and Mass Incarceration	543
Notes and Questions	545

PART II. RECURRING ARGUMENT TYPES THROUGH THE CASES

Chapter Nine. “You Can’t Argue Like That:” Famous Fallacies	549
Orientation	549
<i>Post hoc, ergo propter hoc</i>	550
Federal Trade Commission v. QT, Inc.	551
Affirming the Consequent	554
Denying the Antecedent	556
Wilson v. Clark	557
<i>Argumentum ad hominem</i>	557
Cook Inv. Co. v. Harvey	558
“The Strawman”	560
Washington County v. Kieper	560
<i>Argumentum ad ignorantiam</i>	563
Alabama-Tombigbee Rivers Coalition v. Kempthorne.....	563
“The Slippery Slope”	566
“Begging the Question” (<i>petitio principii</i>).....	568

Fallacies of Composition and Division	570
Rosen v. Unilever U.S., Inc.	570
The False Dilemma	574
Fallacies of Interrogation	576
United States v. Eddy	576
Appeals to Motives	583
Petracca v. Petracca	583
<i>Tu quoque</i>	589
The Naturalist Fallacy.....	590
The Hasty Generalization (“The Fallacy of the Lonely Fact” or “The Fallacy of Converse Accident” or “Observational Selection”)	591
State v. Smith	591
The False Analogy.....	592
Haglund v. Philip Morris, Inc.	592
<i>Argumentum ad lazarum vel ad crumenam</i>	595
Fallacy of Flamboyance	596
“The Genetic Fallacy”.....	596
<i>Ignoratio elenchi</i>	597
“Invincible Ignorance” (a.k.a. The Ostrich Syndrome)	598
“The Undistributed Middle”	598
Hernandez v. Denton	598
Fallacies of Ambiguity	600
Readings	601
Aristotle, On Sophistical Refutations	601
W. Ward Fearnside & William B. Holther, Fallacy: The Counterfeit of Argument	608
Notes and Questions	613
Chapter Ten. Structures of Legal Argument (I): Framing the Issue	617
Orientation	617
A. Tort Versus Contract.....	619
Levy v. Daniels’ U-Drive Auto Renting Co.	619
Notes and Questions	621
B. Procedure Versus Substance	624
Grant v. McAuliffe.....	624
Notes and Questions	627
C. Matters of Fact Versus Matters of Law	628
Saul Ornelas v. United States	629
Notes and Questions	634
D. The Public Domain Versus the Private Domain	636
Republic of Argentina v. Weltover, Inc.	636
Notes and Questions	641
E. Framing at the Supreme Court.....	643
DeShaney v. Winnebago County Dept. of Social Services	643
DeShaney v. Winnebago County Dept. of Social Services	643
Notes and Questions	657

Readings.....	659
Laurence H. Tribe, <i>The Curvature of Constitutional Space: What Lawyers Can Learn from Modern Physics</i>	659
Notes and Questions	675
W. Bradley Wendel, <i>Explanation in Legal Scholarship: The Inferential Structure of Doctrinal Legal Analysis</i>	676
Alan M. Trammell, Derek E. Bambauer, <i>Personal Jurisdiction and the “Interwebs”</i>	679
Notes and Questions	683
Chapter Eleven. Structures of Legal Argument (II): Reasoning by Default: Fictions, Burdens, and Presumptions	685
Orientation	685
A. Legal Fictions	686
1. The Reasonable Person	687
a. The Reasonable “Man” in Torts	687
Vaughan v. Menlove	688
Notes and Questions.....	689
b. The Reasonable Woman in Employment Law	694
Ellison v. Brady	694
c. The Reasonable Police Officer in Immunity Cases.....	702
Amore v. Novarro.....	702
Notes and Questions.....	710
2. A “Constructive” Anything Is Fictional.....	711
a. Constructive Evictions	711
Gottdiener v. Mailhot	711
b. Constructive Trusts	715
Rowe v. Kingston	715
c. Constructive Termination from Employment.....	716
Brady v. Elixir Industries	716
Notes and Questions.....	718
3. Fictions as the Scaffolding for Updating (or Improving) the Law	722
Wood v. Lucy, Lady Duff-Gordon	723
Notes and Questions	724
Readings.....	725
Peter J. Smith, <i>New Legal Fictions</i>	725
Notes and Questions.....	730
B. Burdens.....	731
1. The “Burden of Proof” Unpacked.....	732
Director, Office of Workers’ Compensation Programs v. Greenwich Collieries	732
2. The “Burden of Proof” Applied.....	735
Schaffer v. Weast	735
Notes and Questions	743
C. Presumptions.....	744
Vlandis v. Kline	745

Shaw v. Murphy	751
Notes and Questions	755
Chapter Twelve. Structures of Legal Argument (III): Statutory	
Authority and Legisprudence.....	759
Orientation	759
A. The “Plain Meaning” Rule and Arguments from Absurdity	761
Holy Trinity Church v. United States.....	761
Tennessee Valley Authority v. Hill	767
Notes and Questions	776
B. Canons of Construction.....	781
United States v. DiCristina	781
Readings.....	790
Karl N. Llewellyn, Remarks on the Theory of Appellate Decision and the Rules or Canons About How Statutes Are To Be Construed	791
Notes and Questions	798
C. Paradox Alert: The Necessity and the Impossibility of Relying on Legislative History	807
Stephen Breyer, On the Uses of Legislative History in Interpreting Statutes	807
Notes and Questions	824
D. “Dynamic Statutory Construction” and Its Critics	826
Ronald Dworkin, Law’s Empire	826
William N. Eskridge, Jr., Dynamic Statutory Interpretation	829
Amanda L. Tyler, Continuity, Coherence, and the Canons.....	831
Notes and Questions	834
Chapter Thirteen. Structures of Legal Argument (IV): The Power	
of Precedent Reconsidered	835
Orientation	835
A. Precedent and Its Limits	838
Bowers v. Hardwick	838
Lawrence v. Texas	844
Notes and Questions	852
B. Precedent in Limbo	860
Syscomm Intern. Corp. v. SynOptics Communications, Inc.....	860
Notes and Questions	862
C. Distinguishing a Precedent’s Holding from Its Reasoning and Its Dicta	864
United States v. Ronder.....	872
Notes and Questions	878
Readings.....	880
H.L.A. Hart, The Concept of Law	880
Frederick Schauer, Precedent	882
[Judge] Pierre N. Leval, Judging Under the Constitution: Dicta About Dicta	888

Notes and Questions	900
---------------------------	-----

PART III. PERSPECTIVES TESTED

Chapter Fourteen. Theories of Law Tested: Is International Law Really “Law?”	907
Orientation	907
Statute of the International Court of Justice	910
A. International Law in International Courts	912
Velásquez-Rodríguez Case (Judgment of July 29, 1988)	912
Notes and Questions	924
B. Customary International Law in Domestic Courts.....	927
Filártiga v. Peña-Irala	927
Notes and Questions	940
C. Treaties in Domestic Courts	944
United States v. Alvarez-Machain	944
Notes and Questions	956
Readings.....	959
1. International Law and Positivism.....	959
John Austin, The Province of Jurisprudence Determined (1832).....	959
H. L. A. Hart, The Concept of Law	959
Hans Kelsen, The Pure Theory of Law and Analytical Jurisprudence	960
Notes and Questions	964
2. International Law and Natural Law.....	965
Mary Ellen O’Connell, The Power and Purpose of International Law: Insights from the Theory and Practice of Enforcement.....	965
Notes and Questions	968
3. International Law and Legal Realism	970
Jack Goldsmith & Eric Posner, The New International Law Scholarship.....	970
Roger Fisher, Bringing Law to Bear on Governments.....	972
Notes and Questions	975
4. International Law and the Legal Process School.....	976
Abram Chayes, Thomas Ehrlich, & Andreas F. Lowenfeld, International Legal Process: Materials for an Introductory Course xiii–iv	976
Harold Koh, Transnational Legal Process	977
Notes and Questions	979
5. International Law and Economics	980
Joel P. Trachtman, The Economic Structure of International Law	980
Mohammed Bedjaoui, Towards a New International Economic Order.....	983
Notes and Questions	985

6.	International Law and Critical Legal Studies (a.k.a. “New Stream Scholarship”)	987
	Martii Koskenniemi, From Apology to Utopia: The Structure of International Law Argument.....	987
	Notes and Questions	988
7.	International Law and Feminist Jurisprudence	990
	Hilary Charlesworth, Christine Chinkin, & Shelley Wright, Feminist Approaches to International Law	990
	Notes and Questions	997
8.	International Law and Critical Race Theory.....	998
	Makau Mutua, Critical Race Theory and International Law: Convergence and Divergence	998
	Notes and Questions	1002
9.	The New Haven School: A Policy-Oriented Jurisprudence	1003
	W. Michael Reisman, Siegfried Wiessner & Andrew R. Willard, The New Haven School: A Brief Introduction	1005
	Notes and Questions	1008
	INDEX.....	1011