

# Table of Contents

---

PREFACE ..... V

**Introduction** ..... 1

1. Dueling Op-Eds..... 2

    “My Sudden Acceleration Nightmare” ..... 2

    “Why We Need Trial Lawyers” ..... 5

2. Observations ..... 7

3. Organization of This Book ..... 9

## **PART ONE. HISTORY AND BASIC STRUCTURE OF PRODUCTS LIABILITY LAW**

**Chapter 1. Julian Felipe’s Case** ..... 13

Questions About Julian Felipe’s Case..... 14

**Chapter 2. From Old to New: A Primer on the Rise of  
Products Liability** ..... 15

1. Introduction ..... 15

    “This isn’t my face. I used to be real pretty.” ..... 17

    Questions..... 24

2. Classic Early Cases ..... 25

    A. Winterbottom v. Wright ..... 25

    B. Thomas v. Winchester ..... 26

    C. MacPherson v. Buick ..... 26

3. Eliminating Privity: From Implied Warranty to Strict  
Liability ..... 28

    A. Implied Warranty and Tort Liability ..... 28

        Questions About Julian Felipe’s Case ..... 30

    B. The Road to Strict Liability ..... 30

        (1) Escola v. Coca-Cola Bottling Co. of Fresno ..... 30

        (2) Greenman v. Yuba Power Products ..... 32

        Question ..... 32

    C. How “Strict” Is Strict Liability? ..... 35

        (1) Pulley v. Pacific Coca-Cola Bottling Co. .... 35

            Question..... 36

            Questions ..... 38

            Questions About Julian Felipe’s Case ..... 38

**Chapter 3. Threshold Issues for Modern Products  
Liability** ..... 39

1. What Is the “Sale of a Product?” ..... 39

    Questions..... 44

2.	Safety v. Insurance: Justice Traynor’s Reasons for Enacting Strict Liability.....	45
	Questions About Julian Felipe’s Case.....	50
<b>Chapter 4. “Non-Strict” Theories of Products Liability .....</b>		<b>51</b>
1.	Negligence .....	51
	A. Salient Characteristics of a Negligence Suit .....	53
	(1) No Privity Is Needed.....	53
	(2) Plaintiff’s Conduct Is Relevant .....	53
	(3) A Presumption of Negligence Is Possible .....	54
	(4) No Punitive Damages .....	54
2.	Tortious Misrepresentation .....	54
	A. Types of Misrepresentation Suits .....	54
	(1) Fraud (Intentional Misrepresentation) .....	54
	(2) (Unintentional) Misrepresentation.....	55
	Questions .....	57
3.	Breach of Warranty .....	58
	A. Express Warranty.....	58
	B. Implied Warranty of Merchantability .....	60
	C. Implied Warranty of Fitness for a Particular Purpose .....	63
	Questions About Julian Felipe’s Case.....	63

## PART TWO. ANALYSIS OF PRODUCTS LIABILITY LAW

<b>Chapter 5. “Strict” Liability: Who May Sue Whom? .....</b>		<b>67</b>
1.	Who Is Strictly Liable?.....	67
	A. Component Manufacturers .....	68
	B. Downstream Sellers.....	70
	C. Service Providers .....	71
	D. Owners of Subsidiaries; Successor Corporations.....	73
	(1) The Shareholder Is the Apparent Manufacturer .....	73
	(2) The Shareholder Is So Closely Related to the Manufacturer Corporation as to Be Its Alter Ego ....	74
	(3) The Defendant Has Purchased the Shares or the Assets of the Manufacturer .....	74
	E. Lessors.....	75
	F. Franchisors and Trademark Licensors .....	76
	G. Commercial Sellers of Used Products .....	78
	Questions.....	80
	Questions About Julian Felipe’s Case .....	80
	H. Certifiers and Endorsers .....	81
	I. Workplace Accidents and Products Liability .....	84
	(1) May the Employer Be Sued for Contribution by the Product Manufacturer? .....	86

(2) Is an Employer Who Is Also the Manufacturer or Seller of the Product That Injured Its Worker Liable to Her? ..... 88

2. Who Can Sue? ..... 89

    Questions About Julian Felipe’s Case ..... 90

**Chapter 6. The Plaintiff’s Case: Strict Liability for**

**Manufacturing Defects ..... 91**

1. Introduction ..... 91

2. Negligence or Strict Liability? ..... 92

    A. Breakdowns v. Defects v. Negligence ..... 92

    B. Why Must the Defective Product Be “Unreasonably Dangerous?” ..... 96

        Questions ..... 98

3. Special Case: Food and Drink and the “Foreign-Natural” Debate ..... 98

    Question ..... 101

    Questions About Julian Felipe’s Case ..... 102

4. Special Case: Prescription Drugs and Manufacturing Defects ..... 102

**Chapter 7. The Plaintiff’s Case: Strict Liability for**

**Design Defects ..... 105**

1. Introduction ..... 105

2. Tests for Design Defect ..... 108

    A. Negligence ..... 108

        Question About Julian Felipe’s Case ..... 109

    B. The Consumer Expectations Test ..... 109

        Questions About Julian Felipe’s Case ..... 112

    C. The Risk-Utility Test ..... 113

        Question ..... 116

    D. Two-Pronged Standards ..... 116

        Question About Julian Felipe’s Case ..... 118

    E. *Restatement (Third)*’s Design Defect Test ..... 118

3. Proof of Design Defect ..... 119

4. Special Case: Automobiles ..... 123

    Question ..... 126

    Questions About Julian Felipe’s Case ..... 130

5. Special Case: Autonomous Vehicles ..... 133

    A. Legal Issues with Autonomous Cars ..... 138

    B. Potential Non-Common Law Solutions ..... 143

    C. Conclusion ..... 146

6. Practice Tip: Minimizing the Likelihood of Design Defect Liability ..... 146

<b>Chapter 8. The Plaintiff's Case: Strict Liability for</b>	
<b>Informational Defects</b> .....	<b>147</b>
1. Introduction .....	147
2. Negligence or Strict Liability? .....	151
A. The Never-Before-Seen, Conceivable Risk .....	152
Questions .....	153
Questions About Julian Felipe's Case .....	154
B. The Warned-of but Allegedly Underemphasized	
Risk .....	155
Questions .....	156
Question .....	157
C. Obvious but Infinitesimal Risks .....	157
Questions .....	160
3. The How, Who, and When of Warnings .....	161
A. How .....	161
B. Who .....	163
(1) To Whom Should a Warning Be Given? .....	163
(2) By Whom Should the Warning Be Given? .....	164
C. When .....	164
4. Special Case: Prescription Drugs and Vaccines .....	166
A. General Principles .....	166
B. The Impact of Mass Marketing of Prescription	
Drugs .....	170
C. Attorney General <i>Parens Patriae</i> Suits and <i>Class</i>	
<i>Action Fairness Act</i> Removal .....	172
D. An Insurance Alternative to Products Liability: The	
<i>National Childhood Vaccine Injury Act</i> ("NCVIA") .....	174
<b>Chapter 9. The Plaintiff's Case: Causation</b> .....	<b>177</b>
1. Introduction .....	177
2. Cause in Fact (Necessary Condition) .....	178
A. <u>Whodunit</u> ? .....	179
B. <u>Why</u> Did It Happen? .....	183
(1) Causation in Fact: Manufacturing and Design	
Defects .....	183
(2) Causation in Fact: Informational Defects .....	185
C. <u>When</u> Was the Defect Introduced? .....	188
D. Camels' Backs: "Substantial Factor" and Cause in	
Fact .....	189
3. Proximate Causation .....	190
A. Introduction .....	190
B. Product Danger X, Harm Y .....	192
Question .....	194
C. Superseding ("Intervening") Causes .....	195
(1) Third-Party Misconduct .....	195

(2) User Negligence (Other than Misuse) ..... 197

(3) Criminal Action Motivating Purchase of  
 Product..... 198

    Questions ..... 198

    Questions About Julian Felipe’s Case ..... 199

**Chapter 10. The Defendant’s Case: Affirmative Defenses  
 to Defectiveness Claims..... 201**

1. Introduction ..... 201

2. The Injured User (or the User’s Employer) Chose to Use  
 the Product in a Dangerous Way..... 202

    A. The Product Was Misused..... 202

        Question ..... 202

        Questions..... 204

        Question ..... 205

    B. The Product Was Obviously Dangerous..... 207

    C. The Product Was Inherently Dangerous..... 208

    D. The Product Was Altered ..... 211

    E. The Product Was “Made to Order” ..... 213

        Questions About Julian Felipe’s Case ..... 215

3. Too Much Time Has Passed to Hold Defendant Liable ..... 215

    A. The Product’s Useful Life Had Expired..... 215

        (1) Deterioration ..... 215

        (2) Disposal and Destruction ..... 218

    B. The Harm Was Intergenerational (No Harm Caused  
 to the User)..... 220

    C. The Legislature Has Said It’s Too Late to Sue ..... 221

        (1) Statutes of Limitation..... 221

        (2) Statutes of Repose..... 222

4. “State of the Art” Defense (the Product Was as Safe as It  
 Could Be)..... 223

    A. General Comments ..... 223

        Questions..... 224

        Question ..... 224

        Questions..... 225

    B. “State of the Art” and Informational Defects..... 227

    C. “State of the Art” and Design Defect ..... 230

        Question ..... 230

    D. “State of the Art” and Post-Sale Duties..... 233

        Questions About Julian Felipe’s Case ..... 236

5. Regulatory Preemption Defense (the Product Was as Safe  
 as the Government Required)..... 236

    A. The Problem ..... 236

        Questions About Julian Felipe’s Case ..... 240

    B. The Supreme Court’s “Solution” ..... 241

6.	The Standards Defense (Our Product Was as Safe as Our Competitors' Product).....	251
	Question About Julian Felipe's Case .....	252

### **Chapter 11. The Defendant's Case: Causation and Other**

	<b>Peoples' Behavior.....</b>	<b>253</b>
1.	Introduction .....	253
2.	Contributory Negligence .....	254
3.	Comparative Negligence .....	257
	A. General Remarks .....	257
	B. Complicating Factor: Multiple Defendants.....	261
4.	Assumption of Risk.....	264
	Question About Julian Felipe's Case .....	266
5.	"Last Clear Chance" .....	266

### **Chapter 12. The Defendant's Case: Other Affirmative**

	<b>Defenses.....</b>	<b>269</b>
1.	Introduction .....	269
2.	"I Made It, but Someone Else Designed It".....	269
	Question About Julian Felipe's Case .....	270
	A. Contracts Specification Defense .....	270
	B. Government Contractor Defense .....	272
3.	"It Wouldn't Have Made a Difference if I Had Warned You" .....	273
	A. Plaintiff Did Not Read the (Allegedly Inadequate) Warning That Was Given, and Therefore Would Not Have Read the Adequate Warning That Should Have Been Given .....	275
	Note: "Warning Pollution" and Causation in Failure to Warn Cases .....	280
	B. The Victim Was Warned by Other Means, So the Lack of Warning on the Product Was of No Consequence .....	281
	C. A Learned Intermediary Knew of the Risk, Despite the Lack of Warning, and the Intermediary Failed to Warn the Victim; <i>or</i> the Intermediary Ignored the Inadequate Warning and Would Also Have Ignored an Adequate Warning.....	281
	D. Special Circumstances of the Injury Make It Virtually Impossible That Any Warning, Had It Been Given, Could Have Been Heeded.....	283
	Questions.....	283
4.	"We Had Agreed That I Wouldn't Be Liable for This" .....	284
	Questions.....	289
	Questions About Julian Felipe's Case .....	289
5.	"You're Paid to Face These Dangers" .....	289

**Chapter 13. Damages ..... 293**

1. Introduction: Additional Facts About Julian Felipe’s Case ..... 293
  - Questions About Julian Felipe’s Case ..... 295
2. Compensatory Damages for Personal Injury and Death ..... 295
  - A. Wage Loss ..... 296
  - B. Pain and Suffering ..... 297
    - Question About Julian Felipe’s Case ..... 299
  - C. Fear of Future Injury and Medical Monitoring ..... 300
  - D. Wrongful Death ..... 301
3. Other Compensatory Damages ..... 302
  - A. Economic Damage to Tangible Property (Other than to the Product Itself) ..... 302
  - B. “Pure” Economic Loss ..... 303
    - (1) A Third Party Suffers Physical Injury ..... 303
    - (2) No One Is Physically Injured, but Property Damage Occurs ..... 304
    - (3) Damage Occurs to the Product Itself ..... 305
  - C. Additional Compensatory Damages in Case of Alleged Fraud ..... 307
4. Punitive Damages ..... 308
  - Questions About Julian Felipe’s Case ..... 312

**PART THREE. SPECIAL SITUATIONS  
AND PROPOSED ALTERNATIVES  
TO PRODUCTS LIABILITY LAW**

**Chapter 14. Special Types of Product Litigation: Toxic Substances and Class Actions ..... 321**

1. Introduction ..... 321
2. Judicial Administration of Toxic Products Cases ..... 326
3. Causation Problems in Toxic Products Cases ..... 328
  - A. Plaintiff’s Behavior as a Contributing Cause to Toxic Products Liability ..... 333
4. Damages Issues in Toxic Products Claims ..... 333
  - A. Potential but Unrealized Disease ..... 334
  - B. Property Damage and Loss of Profits ..... 334
  - C. Punitive Damages ..... 336
    - Questions About Julian Felipe’s Case ..... 336

**Chapter 15. The Defendant’s Case: Federal Jurisdiction and Federal Defenses ..... 339**

1. Introduction ..... 339
2. Limits of State Court Jurisdiction over Mass Torts ..... 339
3. Attorney General *Parens Patriae* Suits and Class Action Fairness Act Removal ..... 341

<b>Chapter 16. Alternative Approaches to Ensuring</b>	
<b>Product Safety .....</b>	<b>343</b>
1. Introduction .....	343
2. Replacing Products Liability with Contract .....	343
A. Libertarian Abolition of Products Liability.....	343
B. Free Choice of State Law .....	344
3. Replacing State Products Liability Law with a National	
Law .....	347
A. Federal Legislation.....	347
B. Uniform State Laws of Product Liability .....	349
C. Federal Common Law .....	349
4. International Approaches to Products Liability Law.....	352
A. Europe .....	352
B. Japan .....	353
C. Canada.....	353
5. Replacing Products Liability with Social Insurance .....	354
Questions About Julian Felipe’s Case.....	356
6. New Frontiers .....	356
<b>Appendix. The Simple Economics of Products Liability</b>	
<b>Law .....</b>	<b>359</b>
1. Design Defects: Design Choice by Manufacturer .....	359
A. Manufacturers and Consumers Understand	
Product Risks .....	360
(1) Strict Liability.....	360
(2) Negligence .....	360
(3) No Liability.....	360
B. Manufacturers Understand Product Risks, Consumers	
Underestimate Them.....	361
(1) Strict Liability.....	361
(2) Negligence .....	361
(3) No Liability.....	361
C. Consumers Are Rational and Can Affect the Accident	
Rate.....	362
(1) Strict Liability.....	362
(2) Negligence .....	362
D. What if a Third Party Is Injured?.....	363
(1) Strict Liability.....	363
(2) Negligence .....	363
2. Manufacturing Defects: Quality Control .....	364
Questions.....	365
TABLE OF CASES .....	367
INDEX.....	375