

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE	III
TABLE OF CASES	XXI
Chapter 1. Introduction	1
State and Local Taxation: An Introduction to the Field	1
A. The Eclectic Expertise of State and Local Tax Lawyers	2
B. A Brief Overview of U.S. Subnational Public Finance	3
1. State Tax Revenues: Income and Sales Taxes	6
2. Local Tax Revenues: Property Taxes	7
3. Diversity in the Tax Mix Among the States	9
C. The Legal Framework of U.S. State and Local Taxation	10
1. Federal Constitutional Limitations on State and Local Taxes	11
2. Federal Statutory Limitations on State and Local Taxes	11
3. State Constitutional Limitations on State and Local Taxes	12
D. Key Institutions in U.S. State and Local Taxation	13
E. The Anatomy of a State Tax Case	15
1. Filing the Tax Return: The “Return Position”	15
2. State Administrative Proceedings	17
3. State Judicial Proceedings	17
4. U.S. Supreme Court Proceedings	18
F. Additional Resources for Learning About U.S. State and Local Taxation	19
G. A Note on the Structure of the Book	20

PART 1. CONSTITUTIONAL FOUNDATIONS OF STATE AND LOCAL TAX

Chapter 2. Jurisdiction to Tax	25
A. Constitutional Limits on State Taxing Jurisdiction	25
Miller Bros. Co. v. State of Maryland	27
Notes and Questions	32
B. The Rise and Fall of the “Physical Presence” Standard for State Taxing Jurisdiction	33
South Dakota v. Wayfair, Inc.	36
Notes and Questions	56
C. Constitutional Parameters of State Income Tax Jurisdiction	58
Geoffrey, Inc. v. South Carolina Tax Commission	59
Notes and Questions	65
Griffith v. ConAgra Brands, Inc.	68
Notes and Questions	74

D.	Federal Statutory Limitations on State Tax Jurisdiction: Public Law 86–272	75
	Public Law 86–272	75
	Notes and Questions	77
	Wisconsin Department of Revenue v. William Wrigley, Jr., Co.	79
	Notes and Questions	93
Chapter 3. State Taxes as Regulation of Interstate and Foreign Commerce		
Commerce		
A.	Historical Background of the Commerce Clause	99
B.	The <i>Complete Auto</i> Framework for Commerce Clause Challenges	105
	Complete Auto Transit, Inc. v. Brady	105
	Notes and Questions	115
1.	First Prong: Substantial Nexus (Revisited)	116
	Tyler Pipe Industries, Inc. v. Washington State Department of Revenue	116
	Notes and Questions	118
2.	Second Prong: Fair Apportionment	119
	Norfolk and Western Railway Company v. Missouri State Tax Commission	120
	Notes and Questions	126
3.	Third Prong: Nondiscrimination	127
	Camps Newfound/Owatonna, Inc. v. Town of Harrison	128
	Notes and Questions	140
	Comptroller of the Treasury of Maryland v. Wynne	149
	Notes and Questions	166
	Cuno v. DaimlerChrysler, Inc.	167
	Notes and Questions	176
4.	Fourth Prong: Fair Relation to Services Provided by the State	177
	Commonwealth Edison Co. v. Montana	177
	Notes and Questions	189
5.	Reprise: <i>Complete Auto</i> 's Commerce Clause Test Reexamined	190
	Goldberg v. Sweet	191
	Notes and Questions	200
C.	Restrictions on State Taxation of Foreign Commerce	202
	Japan Line, Ltd. v. County of Los Angeles	202
	Notes and Questions	211
D.	The Role of Congress in Regulating Interstate/Foreign Commerce	214
1.	The Power of Congress to Regulate State Taxing Authority	215
	Notes and Questions	215
2.	State Taxes That Conflict with or Frustrate Federal Policy	218
3.	Federal Legislation Restricting State Power to Tax	221
E.	The Import-Export Clause	222
1.	State Taxation of Imports	222
	Michelin Tire Corp. v. Wages	222
	Notes and Questions	233

2.	State Taxation of Exports	236
	Department of Revenue of the State of Washington v. Association of Washington Stevedoring Companies	236
	Notes and Questions	243
Chapter 4. The Constitutional Requirements of Equality and		
	Uniformity	247
A.	State Constitutional Uniformity and Equality Clauses	248
1.	Introduction	248
2.	The Scope of State Uniformity and Equality Provisions	250
3.	The Operation of State Uniformity and Equality Provisions	252
	In re Opinion of the Justices.....	252
	Notes and Questions	255
B.	Equal Protection of the Laws	257
1.	Classification of Property and Taxpayers	258
	Armour v. City of Indianapolis	258
	Notes and Questions	268
2.	The Equal Protection Clause and Property Tax Disparities	269
	Nordlinger v. Hahn.....	270
	Notes and Questions	285
3.	Separate Classification of Foreign and Domestic Corporations: The Insurance Company Cases	288
	Metropolitan Life Insurance Company v. Ward.....	290
	Notes and Questions	300
4.	Separate Classification of Foreign and Domestic Corporations: The Non-Insurance Cases	303
	Notes and Questions	303
5.	Discrimination Against Nonresident Individuals	307
	Notes and Questions	307
C.	Privileges and Immunities.....	309
1.	Introduction	309
2.	Limitations on State Taxation Under Article IV, Section 2	310
	Austin v. New Hampshire.....	310
	Notes and Questions	318
	Lunding v. New York Tax Appeals Tribunal.....	319
	Notes and Questions	329
Chapter 5. Immunity of Federal Instrumentalities from State		
	Taxation	333
A.	Sales, Use, Gross Receipts, and Other Excise Taxes	333
	United States v. New Mexico.....	333
	Notes and Questions	345
B.	Property Taxes.....	349
1.	Property Owned by the Federal Government.....	349
	Notes and Questions	349
2.	The Magnitude of Tax-Immune Federal Property	351
	Payments in Lieu of Taxes on Federal Real Property	351

Notes and Questions	352
C. State Taxes Discriminating Against the Federal Government	353
Davis v. Michigan Department of Treasury	353
Notes and Questions	361
D. Federal Statutory Rules Governing Federal Immunity from State Taxation	363
1. State Taxation of Federal Obligations	364
Notes and Questions	364
2. State Taxation of National Banks	365
Notes and Questions	365
3. Other Congressional Legislation Creating Federal Immunity from State Taxation	366
Notes and Questions	366
E. State Taxation of Indian Tribes	367

PART 2. MAJOR STATE AND LOCAL TAXES

Chapter 6. Personal Income Taxes.....	373
A. Conformity of State Income Taxes to the Federal Income Tax	374
Notes and Questions	375
B. Determination of Residence for State Tax Purposes	379
Notes and Questions	379
C. The Taxation of Income of Residents	383
1. State Power to Tax Residents' Income Regardless of Its Source	383
Notes and Questions	384
2. State Statutory Treatment of Residents' Personal Income	386
D. The Taxation of Income of Nonresidents	386
1. State Power to Tax Nonresidents' Income from Sources Within the State	386
Notes and Questions	388
2. Application of the Source Principle: Statutory and Constitutional Issues	391
Zelinsky v. Tax Appeals Tribunal of the State of New York	392
Notes and Questions	399
3. Application of Progressive Marginal Tax Rates to Nonresident Income	406
Wheeler v. State of Vermont.....	406
Notes and Questions	410
4. Discrimination Against Nonresidents.....	411
E. Change of Residence	411
Notes and Questions	412
F. Taxation of Income from Partnerships	414
Weil v. Chu	415
Notes and Questions	417

G.	Taxation of Income of Trusts and Estates	420
	North Carolina Department of Revenue v. Kimberly Rice Kaestner 1992 Family Trust	420
	Notes and Questions	427
H.	Credit or Allowance for Taxes Paid to Other States	433
	Notes and Questions	434
Chapter 7. Corporate Income Taxes		439
A.	The State Corporate Income Tax Base	442
B.	Division of the Tax Base	444
	1. Apportionment by Formula in General: Federal Constitutional Limitations.....	448
	a. The Apportionable Tax Base.....	449
	Fargo v. Hart.....	450
	Notes and Questions.....	453
	Exxon Corporation v. Wisconsin Department of Revenue	453
	Notes and Questions.....	459
	Allied-Signal, Inc. v. Director, Division of Taxation.....	459
	Notes and Questions.....	473
	b. Fair Apportionment.....	477
	Underwood Typewriter Co. v. Chamberlain	478
	Notes and Questions.....	480
	Butler Bros. v. McCollgan	481
	Notes and Questions.....	485
	Norfolk and Western Railway Company v. Missouri State Tax Commission.....	491
	Notes and Questions.....	491
	Moorman Manufacturing Co. v. Bair	493
	Notes and Questions.....	505
	2. Apportionment by Formula as Applied to Multicorporate Enterprises: Constitutional Limitations.....	509
	Mobil Oil Corporation v. Commissioner of Taxes of Vermont	510
	Notes and Questions	527
	Container Corporation of America v. Franchise Tax Board	534
	Notes and Questions	556
	3. State Court Approaches to the Unitary Business Principle and Combined Reporting: Law and Policy	561
	Notes and Questions	561
	4. The State Statutory Framework Governing Division of Corporate Income	567
	5. The Multistate Tax Compact.....	581
	6. The Right to Apportion or Allocate the Tax Base.....	587
	Notes and Questions	587
	7. Distinguishing Apportionable from Allocable Income Under State Statutes	589
	a. The Business-Nonbusiness Income Distinction Under UDITPA and Similar Statutes.....	590

b.	Apportionment and Allocation of Income from Real and Tangible Personal Property	594
c.	Apportionment and Allocation of Income from Intangible Property in General	595
d.	Apportionment and Allocation of Interest Income	597
	Sperry and Hutchinson Co. v. Department of Revenue	597
	Notes and Questions	599
e.	Apportionment and Allocation of Dividend Income	601
	Notes and Questions	602
f.	Apportionment and Allocation of Capital Gains and Losses	605
g.	Apportionment and Allocation of Income from Patents, Copyrights, and Similar Intangibles	605
8.	The Apportionment Formula: Delineation of the Factors	607
a.	Property Factor	607
	State of Alaska, Department of Revenue v. Amoco Production Company	607
	Notes and Questions	611
b.	Payroll Factor	614
	Cincinnati, New Orleans and Texas Pacific Railway Company v. Kentucky Department of Revenue	615
	Notes and Questions	616
c.	Receipts or Sales Factor	617
	Corporate Executive Board Company v. Virginia Department of Taxation	618
	Notes and Questions	631
9.	Relief Provisions for Varying Statutory Formulas	640
	Microsoft Corporation v. Franchise Tax Board	641
	Notes and Questions	649
10.	Methods of Apportionment for Special Industries	657
	Chapter 8. Sales Taxation.....	659
A.	Introduction	659
1.	The Classification and Nature of Sales Taxes	661
2.	The Growing Fiscal Importance of State and Local Sales Taxes	663
3.	Distribution of the Burden of Retail Sales and Use Taxes	664
4.	Structural Flaws in the Retail Sales Tax: Implications for Legal Analysis	667
B.	Delineation of Taxable Sale	670
1.	Distinguishing Tangible Personal Property from Services or Intangibles	670
	Washington Times-Herald v. District of Columbia	671
	Notes and Questions	673
2.	The “True Object” and Similar Tests	674
	City of Boulder v. Leanin’ Tree, Inc.	675
	Notes and Questions	684

3.	Computer Software and Digital Products	686
4.	Cloud Computing	690
	Letter Ruling 12–10	690
	Ruling 401–12–2	698
	Notes and Questions	700
5.	Sales of a “Bundle” of Distinct Property and Services in a Single Contract	703
	Dell, Inc. v. Superior Court	704
	Notes and Questions	710
6.	Leases of Tangible Personal Property as Sales	711
	Notes and Questions	712
C.	Retail Sale	717
1.	Sale for Resale Exemption	718
	Cincinnati Reds v. Testa	718
	Notes and Questions	728
2.	Manufacturing, Processing, and Fabrication Exemptions	732
	Kaiser Steel Corporation v. State Board of Equalization	733
	Notes and Questions	738
3.	Machinery and Equipment Exemptions	743
	Concord Publishing House, Inc. v. Director of Revenue	744
	Notes and Questions	751
4.	Containers and Packaging	754
D.	Services	755
1.	Repair, Alteration, and Servicing of Tangible Personal Property	757
	Covington Pike Toyota, Inc. v. Cardwell	757
	Notes and Questions	761
2.	Computer, Data Processing, and Information Services	762
	Notes and Questions	762
3.	Cloud Computing Services	764
4.	Telecommunications Services	768
	Ruling No. 95–10	769
	Notes and Questions	771
5.	Internet Access and the Internet Tax Freedom Act	773
6.	Taxable Services and the Sale-for-Resale Exclusion	776
	Notes and Questions	777
E.	Real Estate Construction and Repair	779
	Notes and Questions	779
F.	Miscellaneous Exemptions and Exclusions from Sales and Use Taxes	783
	Notes and Questions	783
G.	Measure of the Sales and Use Tax	787
	Notes and Questions	788
H.	Collection of the Tax by the Vendor	794
	Normand v. Walmart.com USA, LLC	796
	Notes and Questions	800

I.	The Taxation of Interstate Sales	805
1.	Territorial Restrictions on Sales Taxes.....	806
	Notes and Questions	806
2.	Use Taxes	808
	Commissioner of Revenue v. J.C. Penney Company, Inc.....	810
	Notes and Questions	817
3.	Taxation of Interstate Sales and the Out-of-State Vendor's Duty to Collect Sales and Use Taxes	823
	McLeod v. J.E. Dilworth Co.	824
	General Trading Co. v. State Tax Commission of Iowa	824
	International Harvester Co. v. Department of Treasury of Indiana	824
	Notes and Questions	832
4.	Apportionment of the Sales Tax Measure	839
	Oklahoma Tax Commission v. Jefferson Lines, Inc.	840
	Notes and Questions	855
J.	Fundamental Sales Tax Reform and the Streamlined Sales and Use Tax.....	862
1.	Fundamental Sales Tax Reform	862
	Charles E. McLure, Jr., The Nuttiness of State and Local Taxes—And the Nuttiness of Responses Thereto.....	862
	Notes and Questions	867
2.	The Streamlined Sales and Use Tax	870
	Streamlined Sales and Use Tax Agreement	873
	Notes and Questions	883
	Chapter 9. Ad Valorem Property Taxes	887
A.	Property Taxation and Property Rights	887
	Notes and Questions	890
1.	Economic Perspectives on the Property Tax.....	895
2.	Political Challenges to Market-Value Assessment	897
	Notes and Questions	899
3.	Assessing and Collecting the Tax	900
B.	Uniformity and Equality in Assessment	901
1.	Classification and Fractional Assessment	901
2.	Judicial and Legislative Responses.....	902
	People ex rel. Schlaeger v. Allyn	903
	Notes and Questions	908
	Hellerstein v. Assessor of Islip	909
	Notes and Questions	915
	CSX Transportation, Inc. v. Georgia State Board of Equalization	920
	Notes and Questions	926
C.	Approaches to the Valuation of Property.....	930
1.	Methods of Valuing Property.....	930
	Rosbroc Associates v. Assessor and Board of Review of the City of New Rochelle.....	933

	Notes and Questions	940
	Board of Assessment Appeals v. Colorado Arlberg Club	941
	Notes and Questions	944
2.	Special Issues in Land Valuation	944
a.	Valuation of Contaminated Property	944
	Notes and Questions.....	949
b.	Current Use Valuation of Agricultural Land	953
	Notes and Questions.....	954
3.	Non-Market Adjustments to Value	957
	Notes and Questions	959
4.	The Valuation of Special-Purpose Property.....	960
	Joseph E. Seagram & Sons, Inc. v. Tax Commission of the City of New York.....	960
	Joseph E. Seagram & Sons, Inc. v. Tax Commission of the City of New York.....	965
	Notes and Questions	965
5.	The Valuation of Property Subject to Divided Legal Interests	967
a.	Property Subject to a Long-Term Lease.....	967
	In the Matter of Merrick Holding Corp. v. Board of Assessors	968
	Notes and Questions.....	971
b.	Property Subject to Easements and Use Restrictions.....	974
	Village of Ridgewood v. Bolger Foundation	974
	Notes and Questions.....	978
	Twin Lakes Golf and Country Club v. King County	981
	Notes and Questions.....	983
c.	The Valuation of “Big Box” Retail Stores.....	986
	Menard, Inc. v. City of Escanaba.....	986
	Notes and Questions.....	995
D.	Property Tax Exemptions	997
1.	Ownership and Use Test of the Property Tax Exemption	998
	Christian Home for the Aged, Inc. v. Tennessee Assessment Appeals Commission	998
	Notes and Questions	1002
2.	The Delineation of Exempt Activities	1004
	Dove Lewis Memorial Emergency Veterinary Clinic, Inc. v. Department of Revenue.....	1004
	Notes and Questions	1010
	Chapter 10. State Tax Procedure: Assessment, Collection, Refunds, and Judicial Remedies.....	1019
A.	The Assessment of Taxes	1019
	Notes and Questions	1021
B.	Collection of Taxes	1022
	Notes and Questions	1024
C.	Challenging Assessments in Administrative Proceedings	1026

D.	Suits to Recover Taxes	1028
1.	Standing	1028
	Notes and Questions	1028
2.	Burden of Proof.....	1031
	Notes and Questions	1031
3.	Other Issues	1032
	Notes and Questions	1032
E.	Prospective or Retroactive Relief and Other Legal Remedies.....	1035
	McKesson Corporation v. Division of Alcoholic Beverages and Tobacco	1035
	Notes and Questions	1045
F.	Injunctions and Other Equitable Remedies	1053
	Notes and Questions	1053
	INDEX.....	1067