## Table of Contents

**Preface** ......................................................................................................................... III

**Table of Cases** .............................................................................................................. XXI

### Chapter 1. Introduction ................................................................................................. 1

- State and Local Taxation: An Introduction to the Field .............................................. 1
  - A. The Eclectic Expertise of State and Local Tax Lawyers ...................................... 2
  - B. A Brief Overview of U.S. Subnational Public Finance ....................................... 3
    1. State Tax Revenues: Income and Sales Taxes ................................................ 6
    2. Local Tax Revenues: Property Taxes .............................................................. 7
    3. Diversity in the Tax Mix Among the States .................................................... 9
  - C. The Legal Framework of U.S. State and Local Taxation ................................ 10
    1. Federal Constitutional Limitations on State and Local Taxes ...................... 11
    2. Federal Statutory Limitations on State and Local Taxes .......................... 11
    3. State Constitutional Limitations on State and Local Taxes ....................... 12
  - D. Key Institutions in U.S. State and Local Taxation ......................................... 13
  - E. The Anatomy of a State Tax Case .................................................................. 15
    1. Filing the Tax Return: The “Return Position” ............................................. 15
    2. State Administrative Proceedings .............................................................. 17
    3. State Judicial Proceedings ........................................................................... 17
    4. U.S. Supreme Court Proceedings ................................................................ 18
  - F. Additional Resources for Learning About U.S. State and Local Taxation .... 19
  - G. A Note on the Structure of the Book .............................................................. 20

### PART 1. CONSTITUTIONAL FOUNDATIONS

    OF STATE AND LOCAL TAX

### Chapter 2. Jurisdiction to Tax .................................................................................... 25

- Constitutional Limits on State Taxing Jurisdiction .................................................. 25
  - Miller Bros. Co. v. State of Maryland .................................................................. 27
  - Notes and Questions ......................................................................................... 32
- The Rise and Fall of the “Physical Presence” Standard for State Taxing Jurisdiction ...
  - South Dakota v. Wayfair, Inc. ......................................................................... 36
  - Notes and Questions ......................................................................................... 56
- Constitutional Parameters of State Income Tax Jurisdiction ............................ 58
  - Geoffrey, Inc. v. South Carolina Tax Commission ........................................ 59
  - Notes and Questions ......................................................................................... 65
  - Griffith v. ConAgra Brands, Inc. ........................................................................ 68
  - Notes and Questions ......................................................................................... 74
## Table of Contents

### D. Federal Statutory Limitations on State Tax Jurisdiction: Public Law 86–272
- Public Law 86–272
- Notes and Questions
- Wisconsin Department of Revenue v. William Wrigley, Jr., Co.
- Notes and Questions

### Chapter 3. State Taxes as Regulation of Interstate and Foreign Commerce

#### A. Historical Background of the Commerce Clause

#### B. The Complete Auto Framework for Commerce Clause Challenges
- Complete Auto Transit, Inc. v. Brady
- Notes and Questions
- First Prong: Substantial Nexus (Revisited)
  - Tyler Pipe Industries, Inc. v. Washington State Department of Revenue
  - Notes and Questions
- Second Prong: Fair Apportionment
  - Norfolk and Western Railway Company v. Missouri State Tax Commission
  - Notes and Questions
- Third Prong: Nondiscrimination
  - Camps Newfound/Owatonna, Inc. v. Town of Harrison
  - Notes and Questions
  - Comptroller of the Treasury of Maryland v. Wynne
  - Notes and Questions
  - Cuno v. DaimlerChrysler, Inc.
  - Notes and Questions
- Fourth Prong: Fair Relation to Services Provided by the State
  - Commonwealth Edison Co. v. Montana
  - Notes and Questions
- Reprise: Complete Auto’s Commerce Clause Test Reexamined
  - Goldberg v. Sweet
  - Notes and Questions

#### C. Restrictions on State Taxation of Foreign Commerce
- Japan Line, Ltd. v. County of Los Angeles
- Notes and Questions

#### D. The Role of Congress in Regulating Interstate/Foreign Commerce
- The Power of Congress to Regulate State Taxing Authority
- State Taxes That Conflict with or Frustrate Federal Policy
- Federal Legislation Restricting State Power to Tax

#### E. The Import-Export Clause
- State Taxation of Imports
- Michelin Tire Corp. v. Wages
- Notes and Questions
2. State Taxation of Exports ................................................................. 236  
Department of Revenue of the State of Washington v.  
Association of Washington Stevedoring Companies .......... 236  
Notes and Questions ................................................................. 243

Chapter 4. The Constitutional Requirements of Equality and Uniformity ......................................................... 247  
A. State Constitutional Uniformity and Equality Clauses ................................................................. 248  
   1. Introduction ............................................................................. 248  
   2. The Scope of State Uniformity and Equality Provisions ......................................................... 250  
   3. The Operation of State Uniformity and Equality Provisions ......................................................... 252  
      In re Opinion of the Justices ..................................................... 252  
      Notes and Questions ................................................................. 255  
B. Equal Protection of the Laws ................................................................. 257  
   1. Classification of Property and Taxpayers ............................................................................. 258  
      Armour v. City of Indianapolis ..................................................... 258  
      Notes and Questions ................................................................. 268  
   2. The Equal Protection Clause and Property Tax Disparities ......................................................... 269  
      Nordlinger v. Hahn .................................................................. 270  
      Notes and Questions ................................................................. 285  
   3. Separate Classification of Foreign and Domestic Corporations:  
      The Insurance Company Cases .................................................. 288  
      Metropolitan Life Insurance Company v. Ward .................................................. 290  
      Notes and Questions ................................................................. 300  
   4. Separate Classification of Foreign and Domestic Corporations:  
      The Non-Insurance Cases ......................................................... 303  
      Notes and Questions ................................................................. 303  
   5. Discrimination Against Nonresident Individuals ................................................................. 307  
      Notes and Questions ................................................................. 307  
C. Privileges and Immunities ................................................................. 309  
   1. Introduction ............................................................................. 309  
   2. Limitations on State Taxation Under Article IV, Section 2 ......................................................... 310  
      Austin v. New Hampshire ......................................................... 310  
      Notes and Questions ................................................................. 318  
      Lunding v. New York Tax Appeals Tribunal .................................................. 319  
      Notes and Questions ................................................................. 329

Chapter 5. Immunity of Federal Instrumentalities from State Taxation ................................................................. 333  
A. Sales, Use, Gross Receipts, and Other Excise Taxes ................................................................. 333  
   United States v. New Mexico ......................................................... 333  
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 345  
B. Property Taxes ................................................................. 349  
   1. Property Owned by the Federal Government ................................................................. 349  
      Notes and Questions ................................................................. 349  
   2. The Magnitude of Tax-Immune Federal Property ................................................................. 351  
      Payments in Lieu of Taxes on Federal Real Property .................................................. 351
Notes and Questions ........................................................................................................ 352
C. State Taxes Discriminating Against the Federal Government ................................ 353
   Davis v. Michigan Department of Treasury ................................................................. 353
   Notes and Questions .................................................................................................. 361
D. Federal Statutory Rules Governing Federal Immunity from State Taxation .............. 363
   1. State Taxation of Federal Obligations ................................................................ 364
      Notes and Questions .............................................................................................. 364
   2. State Taxation of National Banks ....................................................................... 365
      Notes and Questions .............................................................................................. 365
   3. Other Congressional Legislation Creating Federal Immunity from State Taxation .. 366
      Notes and Questions .............................................................................................. 366
E. State Taxation of Indian Tribes .................................................................................. 367

PART 2. MAJOR STATE AND LOCAL TAXES

Chapter 6. Personal Income Taxes .................................................................................. 373
A. Conformity of State Income Taxes to the Federal Income Tax .................................. 374
   Notes and Questions .................................................................................................. 375
B. Determination of Residence for State Tax Purposes .................................................. 379
   Notes and Questions .................................................................................................. 379
C. The Taxation of Income of Residents ........................................................................ 383
   1. State Power to Tax Residents’ Income Regardless of Its Source .............................. 383
      Notes and Questions .............................................................................................. 384
   2. State Statutory Treatment of Residents’ Personal Income ...................................... 386
D. The Taxation of Income of Nonresidents .................................................................... 386
   1. State Power to Tax Nonresidents’ Income from Sources Within the State .......... 386
      Notes and Questions .............................................................................................. 388
      Zelinsky v. Tax Appeals Tribunal of the State of New York .................................. 392
      Notes and Questions .............................................................................................. 399
   3. Application of Progressive Marginal Tax Rates to Nonresident Income ............... 406
      Wheeler v. State of Vermont .................................................................................... 406
      Notes and Questions .............................................................................................. 410
   4. Discrimination Against Nonresidents .................................................................... 411
E. Change of Residence .................................................................................................... 411
   Notes and Questions .................................................................................................. 412
F. Taxation of Income from Partnerships ...................................................................... 414
   Weil v. Chu .................................................................................................................. 415
   Notes and Questions .................................................................................................. 417
G. Taxation of Income of Trusts and Estates .................................................. 420
   North Carolina Department of Revenue v. Kimberly Rice Kaestner
   1992 Family Trust ......................................................................................... 420
   Notes and Questions ..................................................................................... 427
H. Credit or Allowance for Taxes Paid to Other States ..................................... 433
   Notes and Questions ..................................................................................... 434

Chapter 7. Corporate Income Taxes ..................................................................... 439
A. The State Corporate Income Tax Base ......................................................... 442
B. Division of the Tax Base ............................................................................... 444
   1. Apportionment by Formula in General: Federal Constitutional
      Limitations .................................................................................................... 448
      a. The Apportionable Tax Base ................................................................. 449
         Fargo v. Hart ............................................................................................. 450
         Notes and Questions ................................................................................ 450
         Exxon Corporation v. Wisconsin Department of Revenue ....................... 453
         Notes and Questions ............................................................................. 459
         Allied-Signal, Inc. v. Director, Division of Taxation ............................... 459
         Notes and Questions ............................................................................. 473
      b. Fair Apportionment ................................................................................. 477
         Underwood Typewriter Co. v. Chamberlain ........................................... 478
         Notes and Questions ............................................................................. 480
         Butler Bros. v. McColgan ........................................................................ 481
         Notes and Questions ............................................................................. 485
         Norfolk and Western Railway Company v. Missouri State
         Tax Commission ...................................................................................... 491
         Notes and Questions ............................................................................. 491
         Moorman Manufacturing Co. v. Bair ....................................................... 493
         Notes and Questions ............................................................................. 505
   2. Apportionment by Formula as Applied to Multicorporate
      Enterprises: Constitutional Limitations ......................................................... 509
      Mobil Oil Corporation v. Commissioner of Taxes of Vermont ..................... 510
      Notes and Questions ................................................................................ 527
      Container Corporation of America v. Franchise Tax Board ....................... 534
      Notes and Questions ................................................................................ 556
   3. State Court Approaches to the Unitary Business Principle and
      Combined Reporting: Law and Policy .......................................................... 561
      Notes and Questions ................................................................................ 561
   4. The State Statutory Framework Governing Division of
      Corporate Income ....................................................................................... 567
   5. The Multistate Tax Compact ....................................................................... 581
   6. The Right to Apportion or Allocate the Tax Base ......................................... 587
      Notes and Questions ................................................................................ 587
   7. Distinguishing Apportionable from Allocable Income Under
      State Statutes .............................................................................................. 589
      a. The Business-Nonbusiness Income Distinction Under
         UDITPA and Similar Statutes ................................................................. 590
Table of Contents

b. Apportionment and Allocation of Income from Real and Tangible Personal Property ............................................. 594
c. Apportionment and Allocation of Income from Intangible Property in General .......................................................... 595
d. Apportionment and Allocation of Interest Income ............. 597
   Sperry and Hutchinson Co. v. Department of Revenue ........ 597
   Notes and Questions .................................................. 599
e. Apportionment and Allocation of Dividend Income .......... 601
   Notes and Questions .................................................. 602
f. Apportionment and Allocation of Capital Gains and Losses ...................................................................................... 605
g. Apportionment and Allocation of Income from Patents, Copyrights, and Similar Intangibles ............................ 605

8. The Apportionment Formula: Delineation of the Factors ...... 607
   a. Property Factor .......................................................... 607
      State of Alaska, Department of Revenue v. Amoco Production Company .................................................... 607
      Notes and Questions .................................................. 611
   b. Payroll Factor ............................................................ 614
      Cincinnati, New Orleans and Texas Pacific Railway Company v. Kentucky Department of Revenue ............. 615
      Notes and Questions .................................................. 616
   c. Receipts or Sales Factor ............................................. 617
      Corporate Executive Board Company v. Virginia Department of Taxation ..................................................... 618
      Notes and Questions .................................................. 631

9. Relief Provisions for Varying Statutory Formulas ............... 640
   Microsoft Corporation v. Franchise Tax Board .................. 641
   Notes and Questions ...................................................... 649

10. Methods of Apportionment for Special Industries ............. 657

Chapter 8. Sales Taxation ...................................................... 659
A. Introduction ................................................................. 659
   1. The Classification and Nature of Sales Taxes ................ 661
   2. The Growing Fiscal Importance of State and Local Sales Taxes .............................................................................. 663
   3. Distribution of the Burden of Retail Sales and Use Taxes ...... 664
   4. Structural Flaws in the Retail Sales Tax: Implications for Legal Analysis ............................................................... 667
B. Delineation of Taxable Sale ................................................ 670
   1. Distinguishing Tangible Personal Property from Services or Intangibles .............................................................. 670
      Washington Times-Herald v. District of Columbia .............. 671
      Notes and Questions .................................................. 673
   2. The “True Object” and Similar Tests ............................. 674
      City of Boulder v. Leanin’ Tree, Inc. .............................. 675
      Notes and Questions .................................................. 684
4. Cloud Computing ............................................................... 690
   Letter Ruling 12-10 .......................................................... 690
   Ruling 401-12-2 .............................................................. 698
   Notes and Questions ....................................................... 700
5. Sales of a “Bundle” of Distinct Property and Services in a Single
   Contract ................................................................. 703
   Dell, Inc. v. Superior Court ............................................... 704
   Notes and Questions ....................................................... 710
6. Leases of Tangible Personal Property as Sales ............................ 711
   Notes and Questions ....................................................... 712
C. Retail Sale ........................................................................... 717
1. Sale for Resale Exemption ..................................................... 718
   Cincinnati Reds v. Testa ..................................................... 718
   Notes and Questions ....................................................... 728
2. Manufacturing, Processing, and Fabrication Exemptions ................. 732
   Kaiser Steel Corporation v. State Board of Equalization .............. 733
   Notes and Questions ....................................................... 738
3. Machinery and Equipment Exemptions .................................... 743
   Concord Publishing House, Inc. v. Director of Revenue ................ 744
   Notes and Questions ....................................................... 751
4. Containers and Packaging .................................................... 754
D. Services ............................................................................... 755
1. Repair, Alteration, and Servicing of Tangible Personal
   Property ................................................................. 757
   Covington Pike Toyota, Inc. v. Cardwell ................................ 757
   Notes and Questions ....................................................... 761
2. Computer, Data Processing, and Information Services ................. 762
   Notes and Questions ....................................................... 762
3. Cloud Computing Services ................................................... 764
4. Telecommunications Services ................................................. 768
   Ruling No. 95-10 ............................................................ 769
   Notes and Questions ....................................................... 771
5. Internet Access and the Internet Tax Freedom Act ....................... 773
6. Taxable Services and the Sale-for-Resale Exclusion ...................... 776
   Notes and Questions ....................................................... 777
E. Real Estate Construction and Repair ......................................... 779
   Notes and Questions ....................................................... 779
F. Miscellaneous Exemptions and Exclusions from Sales and Use
   Taxes .............................................................................. 783
   Notes and Questions ....................................................... 783
G. Measure of the Sales and Use Tax .......................................... 787
   Notes and Questions ....................................................... 788
H. Collection of the Tax by the Vendor ......................................... 794
   Normand v. Walmart.com USA, LLC .................................... 796
   Notes and Questions ....................................................... 800
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## I. The Taxation of Interstate Sales

1. Territorial Restrictions on Sales Taxes ................................................. 806
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 806
2. Use Taxes ......................................................................................... 808
   Commissioner of Revenue v. J.C. Penney Company, Inc. ....................... 810
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 817
3. Taxation of Interstate Sales and the Out-of-State Vendor’s Duty to Collect Sales and Use Taxes ......................................................... 823
   McLeod v. J.E. Dilworth Co. ......................................................... 824
   General Trading Co. v. State Tax Commission of Iowa ......................... 824
   International Harvester Co. v. Department of Treasury of Indiana .......... 824
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 832
4. Apportionment of the Sales Tax Measure ........................................... 839
   Oklahoma Tax Commission v. Jefferson Lines, Inc. ............................. 840
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 855

## J. Fundamental Sales Tax Reform and the Streamlined Sales and Use Tax

1. Fundamental Sales Tax Reform ....................................................... 862
   Charles E. McLure, Jr., The Nuttiness of State and Local Sales Tax Measure—And the Nuttiness of Responses Thereto ........................................ 862
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 867
2. The Streamlined Sales and Use Tax ................................................... 870
   Streamlined Sales and Use Tax Agreement ........................................ 873
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 883

## Chapter 9. Ad Valorem Property Taxes ............................................. 887

### A. Property Taxation and Property Rights ........................................ 887
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 890
1. Economic Perspectives on the Property Tax ....................................... 895
2. Political Challenges to Market-Value Assessment ............................... 897
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 899
3. Assessing and Collecting the Tax ..................................................... 900

### B. Uniformity and Equality in Assessment ........................................ 901
1. Classification and Fractional Assessment ......................................... 901
2. Judicial and Legislative Responses .................................................. 902
   People ex rel. Schlaeger v. Allyn ................................................... 903
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 908
   Hellerstein v. Assessor of Islip ....................................................... 909
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 915
   CSX Transportation, Inc. v. Georgia State Board of Equalization .......... 920
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 926

### C. Approaches to the Valuation of Property ..................................... 930
1. Methods of Valuing Property .......................................................... 930
   Rosbroc Associates v. Assessor and Board of Review of the City of New Rochelle ................................................................. 933
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>940</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Assessment Appeals v. Colorado Arlberg Club</td>
<td>941</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>944</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Special Issues in Land Valuation</td>
<td>944</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Valuation of Contaminated Property</td>
<td>944</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>949</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Current Use Valuation of Agricultural Land</td>
<td>953</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>954</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Non-Market Adjustments to Value</td>
<td>957</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>959</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. The Valuation of Special-Purpose Property</td>
<td>960</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joseph E. Seagram &amp; Sons, Inc. v. Tax Commission of the City of New York</td>
<td>960</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joseph E. Seagram &amp; Sons, Inc. v. Tax Commission of the City of New York</td>
<td>965</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>965</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. The Valuation of Property Subject to Divided Legal Interests</td>
<td>967</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Property Subject to a Long-Term Lease</td>
<td>967</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In the Matter of Merrick Holding Corp. v. Board of Assessors</td>
<td>968</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>971</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Property Subject to Easements and Use Restrictions</td>
<td>974</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Village of Ridgewood v. Bolger Foundation</td>
<td>974</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>978</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Twin Lakes Golf and Country Club v. King County</td>
<td>981</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>983</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. The Valuation of “Big Box” Retail Stores</td>
<td>986</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Menard, Inc. v. City of Escanaba</td>
<td>986</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>995</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Property Tax Exemptions</td>
<td>997</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Ownership and Use Test of the Property Tax Exemption</td>
<td>998</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Christian Home for the Aged, Inc. v. Tennessee Assessment Appeals Commission</td>
<td>998</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>1002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The Delineation of Exempt Activities</td>
<td>1004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dove Lewis Memorial Emergency Veterinary Clinic, Inc. v. Department of Revenue</td>
<td>1004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>1010</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Chapter 10. State Tax Procedure: Assessment, Collection, Refunds, and Judicial Remedies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. The Assessment of Taxes</td>
<td>1019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>1021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Collection of Taxes</td>
<td>1022</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>1024</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Challenging Assessments in Administrative Proceedings</td>
<td>1026</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

D. Suits to Recover Taxes ................................................................. 1028
   1. Standing .................................................................................. 1028
      Notes and Questions ............................................................... 1028
   2. Burden of Proof ....................................................................... 1031
      Notes and Questions ............................................................... 1031
   3. Other Issues ............................................................................ 1032
      Notes and Questions ............................................................... 1032

E. Prospective or Retroactive Relief and Other Legal Remedies ...... 1035
   McKesson Corporation v. Division of Alcoholic Beverages and
   Tobacco ......................................................................................... 1035
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 1045

F. Injunctions and Other Equitable Remedies ............................... 1053
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 1053

INDEX .................................................................................................. 1067