

---

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE TO THE FOURTH EDITION.....	V
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS.....	XI
TABLE OF CASES.....	XXXIX
LIST OF MAPS.....	XLIII

## PART I. INTRODUCTION

<b>Chapter 1. What Is International Criminal Law?.....</b>	<b>5</b>
I. Introduction.....	5
II. Transitional Justice Mechanisms.....	5
Ivan Šimonović, Attitudes and Types of Reaction Toward Past War Crimes and Human Rights Abuses, 29 YALE J. INT'L L. 343 (2004).....	5
Notes & Questions.....	12
1. Confronting the Past.....	12
2. Spain.....	12
3. Simple v. Complex Transitions.....	13
4. Truth Commissions.....	13
5. Kenya.....	14
6. A Truth Commission for US Torture?.....	16
7. <i>Gacaca</i> Courts.....	17
8. Lustration.....	18
III. The Purposes of the Criminal Law.....	19
Miriam J. Aukerman, Extraordinary Evil, Ordinary Crime: A Framework for Understanding Transitional Justice, 15 HARV. HUM. RTS. J. 39 (2002).....	19
Notes & Questions.....	24
1. Criminal Trials.....	24
2. Duty to Prosecute.....	24
3. Deterrence.....	26
4. Deterrence in Practice: The Sudan.....	29
5. Creating an Historical Record.....	30
6. Preventing Atrocities.....	30
7. For Further Reading.....	31
Problem.....	31

## PART II. JURISDICTION

<b>Chapter 2. International Jurisdiction.....</b>	<b>37</b>
I. Introduction.....	37
II. The World War II International Military Tribunals.....	38
Robert H. Jackson, Chief of Counsel for the United States, Nuremberg Germany, November 21, 1945.....	39
Notes & Questions.....	44
1. The Defendants.....	44
2. The Purpose of Prosecutions.....	44

3. The Tokyo Tribunal.....	44
The United States of America v. Akaki, Sadao et al., International Military Tribunal for the Far East, Dissident Judgment of Justice R.B. Pal (IMTFE) .....	45
Notes & Questions .....	49
1. The Origins of the WWII Tribunals .....	49
2. The Tokyo Charter .....	50
3. The Tokyo Tribunal.....	51
4. Justice Radhabinod Pal .....	52
5. Critiques of the Tribunals .....	53
6. Occupation Trials .....	53
7. Further Reading.....	54
III. The Modern <i>Ad Hoc</i> International Tribunals .....	54
Prosecutor v. Duško Tadić a/k/a “Dule,” Case No. IT-94-1-AR72, Decision on the Defence Motion for Interlocutory Appeal on Jurisdiction (Oct. 2, 1995) .....	56
Notes & Questions .....	68
1. Alternatives to Chapter VII Resolution.....	68
2. Primacy over Domestic Courts .....	68
3. The Political Question Doctrine in International Criminal Law.....	69
4. <i>Compétence de la Compétence</i> .....	70
5. Judicial Review of Security Council Resolutions .....	70
6. Chapter VII and Internal Armed Conflicts .....	71
7. Article 41 Powers of the Security Council .....	71
8. “Established by Law” .....	71
9. Other Options? .....	73
10. Judge Pal on <i>Tadić</i> .....	73
11. A New Victor’s Justice?.....	74
IV. Completion Strategy .....	74
Notes & Questions .....	78
1. Rule 11 <i>bis</i> .....	78
2. Rights of the Accused Under the Completion Strategy .....	79
3. Further Reading.....	79
<b>Chapter 3. Domestic Jurisdiction .....</b>	<b>81</b>
I. Introduction.....	81
The American Law Institute, RESTATEMENT (FOURTH) OF FOREIGN RELATIONS.....	86
The American Law Institute, RESTATEMENT (THIRD) OF FOREIGN RELATIONS.....	88
United States v. Ali Mohamed Ali, Also Known as Ahmed Ali Adan, Also Known as Ismail Ali .....	90
Notes & Questions .....	100
1. Case Outcome .....	100
2. The Holding .....	100
3. <i>United States v. Yunis</i> .....	100
4. The Hostage Taking Act .....	101
5. Passive Personality Jurisdiction .....	102

6.	Jurisdictional Defenses.....	103
7.	<i>Male Captus Bene Detentus</i> .....	103
8.	Reasonableness.....	105
9.	<i>Aut Dedere Aut Judicare</i> .....	106
II.	Universal Jurisdiction .....	106
	Arrest Warrant of 11 April 2000 (Democratic Republic of the Congo v. Belgium).....	108
	Notes & Questions .....	118
1.	Additional ICJ Opinions .....	118
2.	The Vitality of the Lotus Principle.....	120
3.	Types of Universal Jurisdiction.....	120
4.	The Presence of the Defendant.....	120
5.	Extradition and Universal Jurisdiction .....	121
6.	<i>In Absentia</i> Proceedings.....	122
7.	Human Rights Implications of <i>In Absentia</i> Proceedings .....	122
8.	<i>Parties Civiles</i> .....	123
9.	Amended Belgian Universal Jurisdiction Law.....	124
10.	Crimes Subject to Universal Jurisdiction .....	124
11.	Universal Jurisdiction Under the Genocide Convention .....	125
12.	The Princeton Principles.....	127
13.	Universal Jurisdiction and Immunities.....	128
14.	Universal Jurisdiction in Spain .....	128
	Constitutional Court Judgment No. 237/2005 (Sept. 26, 2005) .....	131
	Notes & Questions .....	138
1.	The Jurisprudence.....	138
2.	Standing of Complainants .....	138
3.	Subsidiarity .....	138
4.	Peruvian Cases.....	139
5.	Strategic Concerns .....	139
6.	The Nexus Requirement .....	140
7.	The 2009 and 2014 Amendments .....	140
8.	<i>Caso Guatemala</i> : Case Update.....	141
9.	The Empirics of Universal Jurisdiction Cases .....	142
10.	Universal Jurisdiction and Neocolonialism.....	142
11.	Universal Jurisdiction in the United States .....	143
12.	Immigration Remedies.....	144
13.	Universal Jurisdiction and Due Process.....	145
14.	For Further Reading .....	145
III.	Courts Martial and Military Commissions .....	146
	<b>Chapter 4. Hybrid Justice Institutions.....</b>	<b>151</b>
I.	Introduction.....	151
II.	The Special Court for Sierra Leone .....	152
	Prosecutor v. Morris Kallon et al., Case No. SCSL-2004-15- AR72(E), Decision on Constitutionality and Lack of Jurisdiction (March 13, 2004) .....	155
	Notes & Questions .....	161
1.	Case Outcome .....	161
2.	The Constitutionality of the Special Court.....	161

3.	International v. Domestic Court .....	162
4.	Personal Jurisdiction and Prosecutorial Discretion .....	164
5.	The Sierra Leone Truth and Reconciliation Commission....	164
6.	Information Sharing .....	165
7.	The Risk of Political Spectacles.....	165
8.	Right Against Self-Incrimination.....	166
9.	Timor-Leste .....	167
10.	Child Soldiers .....	168
11.	Liability of Peacekeepers.....	169
12.	Charles Taylor.....	170
III.	The Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia .....	170
	Notes & Questions .....	175
1.	Mixed Composition.....	175
2.	Sources of Criminal Procedure.....	176
3.	Funding Justice.....	176
4.	Subject Matter Jurisdiction.....	177
5.	Genocide.....	177
6.	Amnesty and Pardon.....	178
7.	Statutes of Limitation.....	178
8.	Statutes of Limitation and the Ex Post Facto Prohibition .....	179
9.	Genocide Justice Act .....	181
10.	Tortured Confessions .....	181
11.	For Further Reading .....	182
IV.	Once and Future Hybrid Systems .....	182
A.	Former Yugoslavia .....	182
B.	Timor-Leste .....	183
C.	Lebanon .....	183
D.	Iraqi High Tribunal .....	184
E.	Central African Republic Special Criminal Court .....	185
	Problem.....	186
	<b>Chapter 5. The International Criminal Court .....</b>	<b>189</b>
I.	Introduction.....	189
II.	The ICC in Operation .....	190
	Ronald C. Slye & Beth Van Schaack, The International Criminal Court in Action: Anatomy of a Case (2019) .....	190
	Notes & Questions .....	208
1.	Preconditions to the Exercise of Jurisdiction .....	208
2.	Prosecutorial Discretion at the ICC.....	208
3.	<i>Proprio Motu</i> Powers.....	209
4.	The Security Council and the ICC .....	209
5.	The African Union and the ICC .....	210
6.	For Further Reading .....	210
III.	The United States and the ICC.....	211
	John Bolton, Protecting American Constitutionalism & Sovereignty from International Threats, The Federalist Society (Washington D.C., Sept. 10, 2018) .....	211
	Harold Hongju Koh, International Justice 5.0 (2012).....	214

Notes & Questions .....	217
1. “Unsigning” the Treaty .....	217
2. Binding Third Parties .....	218
3. United States Fears .....	218
4. “Article 98” Agreements.....	219
5. American Servicemembers’ Protection Act of 2002.....	221
6. Funding for the Court .....	222
7. Making Good on Its Threats .....	223
8. For Further Reading .....	224
IV. Complementarity & Admissibility .....	224
Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, Case No. ICC–01/04–168–US–Exp, Judgment on the Prosecutor’s Appeal against the Decision of Pre-Trial Chamber I entitled “Decision on the Prosecutor’s Application for Warrants of Arrest, Article 58” (July 13, 2006).....	225
Notes & Questions .....	230
1. Case Outcome .....	230
2. Gravity .....	231
3. Self-Referral and Complementarity .....	231
4. The Test of Complementarity.....	232
<i>The Prosecutor v. Ruto et al.</i> , Judgment on the Appeal of the Republic of Kenya against the Decision of Pre-Trial Chamber II of 30 May 2011 entitled ‘Decision on the Application by the Government of Kenya Challenging the Admissibility of the Case Pursuant to Article 19(2)(b) of the Statute’, Case No. ICC–01/09–01/11–307 OA (Aug. 30, 2011) .....	233
Notes & Questions .....	237
1. Primacy v. Complementarity.....	237
2. Same Person/Conduct .....	238
3. Complementarity and Due Process .....	238
Situation in Libya, Case No. ICC–01/11–01/11–344–Red, Decision on the Admissibility of the Case Against Saif Al-Islam Gaddafi (May 31, 2013).....	239
Notes & Questions .....	247
1. Case Update.....	247
2. International v. Domestic Crimes .....	250
3. Al-Senussi .....	250
4. Amnesties and the ICC .....	251
5. Universal Jurisdiction and the International Criminal Court .....	251
6. Security Council Referrals and Complementarity .....	252
7. The Afghanistan Situation .....	252
Situation in the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Decision Pursuant to Article 15 of the Rome Statute on the Authorisation of an Investigation into the Situation in the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Case No. ICC–02/17–33 (Apr. 12, 2019) .....	253
Notes & Questions .....	258
1. The Interests of Justice.....	258

2. The Article 98 Agreement and SOFAs.....	258
3. Politicized Opinions?.....	258
4. Withholding Cooperation.....	259
Problems.....	259
1. Myanmar/Burma.....	259
2. United States-Mexico Border.....	262

### PART III. SUBSTANTIVE INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL LAW

Introduction.....	265
Notes & Questions.....	272
1. The Model Penal Code.....	272
2. The <i>Mens Rea</i> of International Crimes.....	273
3. Knowingly.....	274
4. Recklessness and Negligence.....	274
5. Motive.....	275
6. Inchoate Crimes.....	275
<b>Chapter 6. The Legal Regulation of Armed Conflict.....</b>	<b>277</b>
I. Introduction.....	277
II. The Interface of International Humanitarian Law & International Criminal Law.....	278
A. When Does International Humanitarian Law Apply: The Definition of Armed Conflict.....	278
Prosecutor v. Bošković & Tarčulovski, Case No. IT-04-82-T, Judgement (July 10, 2008).....	280
Notes & Questions.....	299
1. Case History and Outcome.....	299
2. Tadić and the Definition of Armed Conflict.....	300
3. Declarations of War.....	300
4. IHL in Domestic Courts.....	301
5. Conflict Classification.....	301
B. International & Non-International Conflicts.....	303
Prosecutor v. Thomas Lubanga Dyilo, Case No. ICC-01/04- 01/06, Judgment Pursuant to Article 74 of the Statute (March 14, 2012).....	306
Notes & Questions.....	320
1. Conflict Classification.....	320
2. Effective v. Overall Control.....	320
3. Armed Activities on the Territory of the Congo.....	321
4. Occupation.....	321
5. Regulation 55.....	322
6. Children Associated with Armed Groups or Forces (So-Called “Child-Soldiers”).....	323
7. Peacekeeping and International Justice.....	324
Problem.....	325
C. Nexus to Armed Conflict.....	328
Prosecutor v. Clément Kayishema & Obed Ruzindana, Case No. ICTR-95-1-T, Judgement (21 May 1999).....	330

Notes & Questions.....	336
1. Case Outcome .....	336
2. Prosecutorial Burden .....	337
3. Nexus and Causation .....	337
4. Alternative Formulations of Required Nexus.....	338
5. Relationship Between Genocide and Armed Conflict .....	339
6. “Chapeau” Elements of War Crimes .....	339
Problem .....	340
<b>Chapter 7. War Crimes .....</b>	<b>343</b>
I. Introduction.....	343
II. “Hague Law”: The Means & Methods of Warfare.....	343
Prosecutor v. Milan Martić, Case No. IT–95–11–A, Decision (October 8, 2008) .....	346
Notes & Questions .....	350
1. Case Update.....	350
2. Cluster Bombs .....	350
3. Landmines .....	352
4. Other Prohibited Weapons .....	353
5. Chemical Weapons Use in Syria .....	354
6. Nuclear Weapons.....	356
7. Robotics and Warfare .....	356
8. Martić’s Article 58 Argument .....	357
9. Implementing the Principle of Distinction .....	358
10. Military Objectives .....	358
11. The Martens Clause .....	360
12. Implementing the Principle of Proportionality .....	361
13. Implementing the Principle of Distinction .....	361
Prosecutor v. Ante Gotovina & Ivan Markač, Case No. IT–06–90–A, Decision (November 16, 2012) .....	362
Notes & Questions .....	371
1. Case Update.....	371
2. Error of Law or Fact? .....	372
3. Competing Narratives.....	372
4. Targeting Martić .....	373
5. Assassination v. Targeted Killing .....	374
6. Proportionality.....	375
7. Direct Participation in Hostilities .....	375
8. NATO Intervention in Kosovo.....	376
Final Report to the Prosecutor by the Committee Established to Review the NATO Bombing Campaign Against the Federal Republic of Yugoslavia.....	378
Notes & Questions .....	383
1. Investigation Outcome .....	383
2. Particular Incidents .....	384
3. Jurisdiction .....	385
4. Crime of Aggression .....	385
5. Weapons Use: Depleted Uranium and Cluster Bombs .....	386

6.	Banković v. Belgium .....	387
7.	The Relativity of IHL .....	388
8.	Negligence v. Recklessness .....	388
9.	Humanitarian Intervention .....	388
10.	Kosovar War Crimes .....	389
	Problem .....	389
III.	“Geneva Law”: Protected Persons and Things .....	394
A.	Civilians as Protected Persons .....	394
	Prosecutor v. Delalić et al., Case No. IT-96-21-A, Judgement (Feb. 20, 2001) .....	397
	Notes & Questions .....	402
	1. Case Outcome .....	402
	2. Nationality Test .....	403
	3. <i>Stare Decisis</i> .....	403
	4. Civilians as Perpetrators .....	404
B.	Combatants as Protected Persons .....	404
	Prosecutor v. Ntaganda, Case No. ICC-01/04-02/06, Judgment (July 8, 2019) .....	407
	Notes & Questions .....	416
	1. Case Update .....	416
	2. Sexual Violence Before the ICC .....	417
	3. Inter-Unit Rape and the War Crimes Nexus Requirement .....	417
	4. Cumulative Charging and Sexual Violence .....	418
	5. War Crimes Prosecutions Involving Syria and Iraq ....	418
	6. War Crimes Against Combatants .....	420
	7. A Uniform Standard .....	420
	Problems .....	420
	1. War Crimes Act of 1996 and Its Amendments .....	420
	2. War Crimes Under the Military Commission Act of 2006 .....	424
	3. Charging War Crimes .....	430
	<b>Chapter 8. Aggression .....</b>	<b>431</b>
I.	Introduction .....	431
	Jonathan A. Bush, “The Supreme . . . Crime” and Its Origins: The Lost Legislative History of the Crime of Aggressive War, 102 COLUM. L. REV. 2324, 2324–2369 (2002) .....	432
II.	Prosecuting Aggression: Nuremberg and Tokyo .....	440
	The United States of America, et al. v. Hermann Wilhelm Goering, et al. Opinion and Judgment (October 1, 1946), <i>reprinted in</i> 41 AM. J. INT’L L. 172, 186 .....	440
	Notes & Questions .....	449
	1. The Elements of Crimes Against the Peace .....	449
	2. Outcome .....	449
	3. Dönitz and Heads of State in the Dock .....	450
	4. Crimes Against the Peace at Tokyo .....	450
	5. Crimes Against the Peace in Subsequent Proceedings .....	451
	6. <i>Nullum Crimen Sine Lege</i> .....	451

7. Victor's Justice.....	452
8. The Separation of the <i>Jus in Bello</i> and the <i>Jus ad Bellum</i> .....	452
III. The United Nations and the Prohibition on the Use of Force.....	452
Nico Schrijver, THE USE OF FORCE UNDER THE U.N. CHARTER: RESTRICTIONS AND LOOPHOLES (2003) .....	453
Notes & Questions .....	460
1. The U.N. Charter and Aggression.....	460
2. The General Assembly and Aggression .....	460
3. The General Assembly's Definition of Aggression .....	462
4. The ICJ and the Prohibition Against Aggression .....	464
5. Self-Defense .....	464
6. Libya.....	465
IV. Contemporary Definition of the Crime of Aggression .....	466
Notes & Questions .....	471
1. Definition .....	471
2. Leadership Clause.....	471
3. Jurisdictional Filters.....	471
4. The Jurisdictional Regime .....	472
5. Negotiating Dynamics.....	473
6. Complementarity and the Crime of Aggression .....	474
7. Domesticating the Crime of Aggression.....	474
8. The Understandings.....	475
9. Humanitarian Intervention.....	476
Problems .....	479
1. Kosovo .....	479
2. North Korea .....	480
3. Stuxnet.....	481
4. Syria .....	483
<b>Chapter 9. Genocide .....</b>	<b>487</b>
I. Introduction.....	487
II. Protected Groups.....	489
The Prosecutor v. Akayesu, Case No. ICTR-96-4-T, Judgement (Sept. 2, 1998).....	489
Notes & Questions .....	498
1. Genocide in Rwanda.....	498
2. Protected Groups .....	499
3. Objective v. Subjective Considerations .....	499
4. Original Intent of the Drafters .....	501
5. National Definitions of Genocide .....	502
6. Codification.....	504
7. A "One-Man Genocide Mission".....	505
III. The Specific Intent to Commit Genocide .....	505
Prosecutor v. Jelisić, Case No. IT-95-10-T, Judgement (Dec. 14, 1999).....	506
Prosecutor v. Jelisić, Case No. IT-95-10-A, Judgement (July 5, 2001).....	513

Notes & Questions .....	517
1. Case Outcome .....	517
2. The Genocide Count .....	517
3. Prosecutorial Discretion .....	518
4. Jelisić on a “One-Man Genocide Mission” .....	519
5. Inferring Intent .....	519
6. Premeditation .....	520
7. Knowledge of the Inevitability of Destruction.....	520
8. Proof of Genocide.....	522
9. Ethnic Cleansing and Genocide in Yugoslavia.....	523
10. Genocidal Intent in Darfur .....	524
Prosecutor v. Omar Hassan Ahmad Al Bashir, Case No. ICC–02/ 05–01/09, Decision on the Prosecution’s Application for a Warrant of Arrest Against Omar Hassan Ahmad Al Bashir (March 4, 2009) .....	524
Notes & Questions .....	538
1. Case Update.....	538
2. Security Council Referral .....	539
3. Al Bashir on the Road .....	540
4. Contextual Elements .....	541
5. Policy or Plan? .....	541
6. Intent .....	542
7. Protected Groups.....	542
8. <i>Actus Reus</i> .....	543
9. Genocide in Darfur? .....	543
10. ICC Article 16, Peace and Justice .....	544
IV. In Whole or in Part .....	544
Prosecutor v. Krstić, Case No. IT–98–33–T, Judgement (Aug. 2, 2001).....	547
Notes & Questions .....	556
1. Case Outcome .....	556
2. Krstić in Prison .....	557
3. The Responsibility of Dutchbat .....	557
4. “In Part” .....	558
5. Attempted Genocide .....	559
Problem.....	560
The Yanomami .....	560
V. The Constitutive Acts of Genocide.....	560
Prosecutor v. Akayesu, Case No. ICTR–96–4–T, Judgement (Sept. 2, 1998).....	561
Notes & Questions .....	569
1. Rape as Genocide .....	569
2. Rape Under International Law .....	570
3. Slow Death.....	570
4. Mental Harm .....	571
5. Preventative Action.....	571
6. Judicial Notice .....	571
7. State Responsibility for Genocide .....	572
8. Burden of Proof? .....	573

9. Genocide and Crimes Against Humanity .....	574
10. For Further Reading .....	574
Problems .....	574
1. Cambodia .....	574
2. Genocide Elsewhere .....	577
<b>Chapter 10. Crimes Against Humanity .....</b>	<b>579</b>
I. History of the Offense of Crimes Against Humanity .....	579
International Military Tribunal (Nuremberg), Judgment and Sentences, October 1, 1946, Reprinted in 41 AM. J. INT'L L. 172 (Jan. 1947) .....	581
Notes & Questions .....	586
1. IMT Outcome .....	586
2. The Role of the Crimes Against Humanity Count at Nuremberg .....	587
3. A New Crime .....	587
4. Crimes Against Humanity at Tokyo .....	587
II. The Contemporary Definition of Crimes Against Humanity .....	588
Notes & Questions .....	590
1. The Elements of Crimes Against Humanity .....	590
2. Crimes Against Humanity Within the ICTY .....	591
Prosecutor v. Zoran Kupreškić et al., Case No. IT-95-16-T, Judgement (Jan. 14, 2000) .....	592
Notes & Questions .....	605
1. Case Outcome .....	605
2. Crimes Against Humanity v. Domestic Crimes .....	606
3. The Definition of Persecution .....	606
4. Persecution in Refugee Law .....	607
5. Klaus Barbie .....	608
6. War Crimes v. Crimes Against Humanity .....	609
7. Combatant Victims of Crimes Against Humanity .....	610
8. <i>Mens Rea</i> .....	612
9. The Longevity of the War Nexus .....	612
10. The Policy Element .....	613
11. The <i>Chapeau</i> Elements of Crimes Against Humanity Within the ICC .....	614
Situation in the Republic of Kenya in the Case of the Prosecutor v. Francis Kirimi Muthaura, Uhuru Muigai Kenyatta and Mohammed Hussein Ali, Case No. ICC-01/09-02/11, Decision on the Confirmation of Charges Pursuant to Article 61(7)(a) and (b) of the Rome Statute (January 23, 2012) (Public Redacted Version) .....	615
Notes & Questions .....	628
1. Case Outcome and Update .....	628
2. Interpretation of the Organizational Policy Requirement .....	629
3. Targeted Population .....	631

III. Constitutive Acts.....	631
A. Sexual Violence .....	631
Prosecutor v. Brima, Kamara & Kanu, Case No. SCSL–2004–16–A, Judgement (Feb. 22, 2008).....	633
Notes & Questions .....	640
1. Case Outcome and Subsequent Cases .....	640
2. The Origins of the Charge .....	640
3. Forced Marriage v. Arranged Marriage.....	641
4. Sexual Violence.....	642
5. Sierra Leonean Law .....	643
6. Forced Marriage as Slavery.....	643
7. Gravity .....	644
8. Forced Marriage Before the ICC .....	644
9. Sexual Violence in International Criminal Law .....	644
10. Prosecutorial Policy.....	645
B. Extermination .....	646
Prosecutor v. Krstić, Case No. IT–98–33–T, Judgement (April 19, 2004).....	646
Notes & Questions .....	650
1. Genocide and Crimes Against Humanity .....	650
2. Crimes Against Humanity and United States Law .....	651
Problems .....	653
1. Female Genital Cutting .....	653
2. Lebanon.....	654
<b>Chapter 11. Torture .....</b>	<b>657</b>
I. Introduction.....	657
John Langbein, The Legal History of Torture, in TORTURE: A COLLECTION, at 93 (Sanford Levinson ed., 2004).....	658
II. Defining Torture in International Criminal Law .....	660
Prosecutor v. Kunarac, et al., Case No. IT–96–23 & 23–1, Judgement (Feb. 22, 2001) .....	662
Prosecutor v. Kunarac, et al., Case No. IT–96–23 & 23–1A, Judgement (June 12, 2002) .....	670
Notes & Questions .....	674
1. Case Outcome .....	674
2. State and Non-State Actors.....	674
3. State Action .....	675
4. The Committee Against Torture and State Action .....	676
5. A Feminist Critique .....	676
6. Prohibited Acts .....	677
7. Purpose .....	677
8. Specific Intent, General Intent and Motive.....	678
9. Torture Before the ICC .....	678
10. Severity: Torture v. Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment .....	679
Prosecutor v. Kunarac, et al., Case No. IT–96–23 & 23–1A, Judgement (June 12, 2002) .....	680

Notes & Questions .....	682
1. Other Outrages upon Personal Dignity .....	682
2. Lasting Impact of Harm.....	682
3. Torture v. CIDT .....	683
4. Torture's Effects .....	685
5. "Torture Lite" .....	686
6. <i>Incommunicado</i> Detention.....	688
Problems .....	688
1. Criminal Abortion .....	688
2. Child Separation Policy .....	689
III. United States' Definitions of Torture .....	692
Notes & Questions .....	697
1. Comparing the Memos .....	697
2. The United States' Understanding .....	698
3. Specific Intent.....	698
4. Additional Memoranda .....	698
Stephen Bradbury, U.S. Department of Justice Office of Legal Counsel .....	699
Notes & Questions .....	714
1. Obama Administration Response.....	714
2. Implementing the Memos .....	714
3. Combined Techniques .....	715
4. Interrogation Theory.....	715
5. "The Waterboard" .....	716
6. Waterboarding Through the Ages .....	717
7. Conditions of Confinement .....	718
8. The Committee Against Torture and the United States .....	719
9. Extraterritorial Application.....	720
10. SERE Training .....	721
11. Doctors and Psychologists.....	721
12. Advice-of-Counsel and Reliance Defenses .....	722
13. Extraordinary Rendition.....	723
14. Extraordinary Rendition and the European Justice System.....	724
15. Does Torture "Work" .....	725
Problems .....	725
1. Force-Feeding .....	725
2. Prosecute or Praise.....	727
<b>Chapter 12. Terrorism.....</b>	<b>731</b>
I. Introduction.....	731
Notes & Questions .....	737
1. A Separate Crime .....	737
2. Asymmetrical Warfare .....	738
3. Terrorism and Acts of War .....	738
4. Law Enforcement, Trials, Efficiency and Efficacy .....	739
5. International v. Domestic Terrorism .....	740
6. <i>Mens Rea</i> .....	740
7. Bases of Jurisdiction over Terrorism .....	741

II. Prosecuting Terrorism at the International Level .....	742
Prosecutor v. Galić, Case No. IT-98-29-T, Judgement (Dec. 5, 2003).....	743
Notes & Questions .....	759
1. Case Outcome .....	759
2. <i>Nullum Crimen Sine Lege</i> and Terrorism .....	759
3. Terrorism Defined .....	760
4. The <i>Actus Reus</i> of the Crime .....	760
5. Prosecuting Terrorism Within U.S. Military Commissions.....	760
6. Terrorism and the ICC.....	761
7. The Special Tribunal for Lebanon.....	761
Interlocutory Decision on the Applicable Law: Terrorism, Conspiracy, Homicide, Perpetration, Cumulative Charging, Case No. STL-11-01/I/AC/R176bis (Feb. 16, 2011).....	763
Notes & Questions .....	781
1. Advisory Opinion? .....	781
2. Methodology.....	782
3. <i>Nullum Crimen Sine Lege</i> .....	782
4. Terrorism Under Customary International Law .....	782
5. Terrorism and Armed Conflict .....	783
6. <i>In Absentia</i> Proceedings.....	783
7. Forms of Responsibility .....	784
8. El Sayed .....	784
9. Security Concerns .....	785
10. For Further Reading .....	785
Problem.....	785
<b>Chapter 13. Charging International Crimes .....</b>	<b>787</b>
Prosecutor v. Kunarac, Case No. IT-96-23-T & IT-96-23/1-T, Judgement (Feb 22, 2001) .....	788
Prosecutor v. Kunarac, Case No. IT-96-23-A & IT-96-23/1-A, Judgement (June 12, 2002) .....	791
Notes & Questions .....	797
1. Cumulative Charging .....	797
2. Cumulative Charging at the ICC .....	798
Prosecutor v. Jean-Pierre Bemba Gombo, Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08, Decision Pursuant to Article 61(7)(a) and (b) of the Rome Statute on the Charges of the Prosecutor Against Jean-Pierre Bemba Gombo (June 15, 2009) .....	799
Notes & Questions .....	804
1. Case Updates.....	804
2. Prosecutorial v. Judicial Discretion in Charging .....	804
3. Fairness to the Accused? .....	805
4. Cumulative Convictions .....	806
5. Convicting Uncharged Crimes .....	807
6. Regulation 55 .....	807

Prosecutor v. Germain Katanga, Case No. ICC–01/04–01/07 OA 13, Judgment on the Appeal of Mr. Germain Katanga Against the Decision of Trial Chamber II of 21 November 2012 Entitled “Decision on the Implementation of Regulation 55 of the Regulations of the Court and Severing the Charges Against the Accused Persons” (March 27, 2013) .....	809
Notes & Questions .....	818
1. Case Outcome .....	818
2. Dissent .....	819
3. Sources of Authority Before the ICC .....	819
4. Defense Strategy and Right to a Fair Trial.....	819
5. Regulation 55 and Victims .....	820
6. Changes to Modes of Responsibility at the ICTY.....	821
7. Charging v. Sentencing.....	822
8. <i>Concursus Delictorum</i> in International Criminal Law.....	822
Problems.....	822
1. Charging War Crimes and Crimes Against Humanity .....	822
2. Extermination and Genocide.....	823

#### PART IV. INDIVIDUAL CRIMINAL RESPONSIBILITY FOR INTERNATIONAL CRIMES

<b>Chapter 14. The Responsibility of Superiors .....</b>	<b>829</b>
I. Introduction.....	829
II. Ordering Offenses .....	830
Prosecutor v. Blaškić, Case No. IT–95–14–A, Judgement (July 29, 2004).....	834
Notes & Questions .....	836
1. Ordering Crimes.....	836
2. <i>Mens Rea</i> .....	837
3. Joinder and Severance .....	837
4. Obeying Orders.....	837
III. The Doctrine of Superior Responsibility .....	838
A. History .....	838
Trial of General Tomoyuki Yamashita, United States Military Commission, Manila, 8th October–7th December, 1945 IV LAW REPORTS OF TRIALS OF WAR CRIMINALS 1 (1948) .....	840
Notes & Questions.....	847
1. Case Outcome .....	847
2. Defense Counsel .....	847
3. General Douglas MacArthur .....	847
4. The Law of Land Warfare Army Field Manual 27–10 .....	848
5. <i>Habeas Corpus</i> .....	849
In re Yamashita.....	850
Notes & Questions.....	855
1. Superior Responsibility Generally .....	855
2. <i>Mens Rea</i> .....	855
3. Admiral Toyoda .....	855

4.	Kōki Hirota and Civilian Superiors .....	857
5.	Subsequent Proceedings .....	858
6.	My Lai .....	859
7.	Enforcing the Doctrine of Superior Responsibility.....	860
8.	Modern Day Military Commissions .....	861
9.	Abu Ghraib.....	861
10.	For Further Reading .....	862
B.	Codification of the Superior Responsibility Doctrine .....	862
	Notes & Questions .....	865
1.	Protocol I and <i>Mens Rea</i> .....	865
2.	Military and Non-Military Superiors.....	866
3.	Non-International Armed Conflicts .....	866
4.	Superior Responsibility and the Khmer Rouge .....	867
C.	The Elements of the Modern Doctrine of Superior Responsibility .....	867
1.	Subordination .....	867
	The Prosecutor v. Delalić et al., Case No. IT-96-21-A, Judgement (Feb. 20, 2001).....	869
	Notes & Questions.....	876
1.	“The Forgotten Case”.....	876
2.	Effective Control and Substantial Influence .....	876
3.	Superior Responsibility During Occupation .....	877
4.	National Reconciliation .....	877
5.	<i>De Jure v. De Facto</i> Superiors .....	878
6.	The Chain of Command .....	879
7.	The Defense.....	879
	Problem.....	880
2.	Civilian Superiors .....	885
	Notes & Questions.....	887
1.	Other Civilian Contexts .....	887
2.	Head of State Liability .....	890
3.	For Further Reading .....	891
3.	Mens Rea .....	892
	Prosecutor v. Blaškić, Case No. IT-95-14-A, Judgement (July 29, 2004) .....	893
	Notes & Questions.....	898
1.	Case Outcome .....	898
2.	<i>Mens Rea</i> .....	899
3.	Superior Responsibility for Genocide.....	901
4.	For Further Reading .....	902
4.	<i>Actus Reus</i> : Omission.....	902
	Prosecutor v. Jean-Pierre Bemba Gombo, Case No. ICC- 01/05-01/08 A, Judgment (June 8, 2018).....	906
	Prosecutor v. Jean-Pierre Bemba Gombo, Case No. ICC- 01/05-01/08 A, Dissenting Opinion of Judges Sanji Mmasenono Monageng & Judge Piotr Hofmański (June 8, 2018) .....	912
	Notes & Questions.....	918
1.	Case Outcome .....	918

2.	The Reaction of Commentators and Victims .....	918
3.	Omissions and Causality.....	919
4.	Standard of Review.....	920
5.	Prevent or Punish.....	921
6.	Dereliction of Duty .....	923
7.	Sentencing.....	923
8.	Causation .....	924
9.	Causation and the ICC.....	925
10.	An Assessment.....	926
11.	For Further Reading .....	927
	Problems .....	927
1.	<i>Yamashita</i> Redux.....	927
2.	The Liability of Latecomers .....	927
<b>Chapter 15. Direct and Indirect Responsibility .....</b>		<b>929</b>
I.	Introduction.....	929
II.	The World War II Experiment in Collective Responsibility .....	930
	Notes & Questions .....	933
1.	Lustration After World War II .....	933
2.	Concentration Camps as Illegal Organizations .....	934
3.	Domestic Laws on Criminal Organizations.....	935
4.	Providing Material Support for Terrorism .....	935
5.	Designated Organizations .....	937
6.	For Further Reading .....	937
III.	Complicity.....	938
	Prosecutor v. Anto Furundžija, Case No. IT-95-17/1-T, Judgement (December 10, 1998).....	939
	Notes & Questions .....	949
1.	Case Outcome .....	949
2.	Principals and Accessories.....	950
3.	The Elements of Complicity.....	950
4.	<i>Mens Rea</i> .....	950
5.	Causality .....	951
6.	Complicity in Genocide .....	951
7.	Mere Presence .....	952
8.	Accessory After-the-Fact.....	952
9.	Bystanders .....	953
10.	Duties of Disclosure .....	954
11.	Rape in International Humanitarian Law .....	955
12.	The Punishment of an Accomplice .....	955
13.	Corporate Complicity .....	955
14.	Foreign Assistance to Armed Groups .....	956
	Prosecutor v. Momčilo Perišić, Case No. IT-04-81-A, Judgement (February 28, 2013).....	957
	Prosecutor v. Momčilo Perišić, Case No. IT-04-81-A, Partially Dissenting Opinion of Judge Liu (Feb. 28, 2013).....	969
	Notes & Questions .....	971
1.	Specific Direction.....	971
2.	<i>Mens Rea</i> or <i>Actus Reus</i> ? .....	972

3.	Paragraph 72 .....	973
4.	Charles Taylor .....	975
5.	Foreign Assistance to Armed Groups, Redux .....	976
6.	For Further Reading .....	977
IV.	Joint Criminal Enterprise .....	977
	Prosecutor v. Tadić, Case No. IT-94-1-A, Judgement (July 15, 1999).....	979
	Notes & Questions .....	990
1.	The Common Purpose Doctrine and Article 7(1) .....	990
2.	<i>Pinkerton</i> Liability .....	990
3.	<i>Mens Rea</i> .....	991
4.	The Reach of Type 3 Liability.....	993
5.	The Breadth of the JCE .....	993
6.	Charging Preferences.....	995
7.	JCE and Other Forms of Liability .....	995
8.	The ICC.....	995
V.	Co-Perpetration.....	996
	Prosecutor v. Lubanga, Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, Judgment Pursuant to Article 74 of the Statute (March 14, 2012) .....	997
	Prosecutor v. Lubanga, Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, Separate Opinion of Judge Adrian Fulford (March 14, 2012).....	1011
	Notes & Questions .....	1013
1.	Case Update.....	1013
2.	Co-Perpetration .....	1014
3.	<i>Mens Rea</i> .....	1014
4.	Co-Perpetration and the <i>Ad Hoc</i> Tribunals.....	1014
5.	<i>Katanga &amp; Chui</i> .....	1015
6.	Other Offenses.....	1016
7.	Girl Soldiers.....	1017
8.	<i>Brady</i> Obligations Under International Criminal Law.....	1018
9.	Witness Proofing .....	1019
	Problem.....	1020
	<b>Chapter 16. Inchoate Crimes: Conspiracy &amp; Incitement .....</b>	<b>1023</b>
I.	Introduction.....	1023
II.	Conspiracy in International Criminal Law.....	1023
III.	Conspiracy in Modern International Criminal Law .....	1026
	Notes & Questions .....	1033
1.	Conspiracy in Comparative Law .....	1033
2.	Merger of Conspiracy and Substantive Offense.....	1034
IV.	Conspiracy as a War Crime.....	1035
	Ali Hamza Ahmad Suliman Al Bahlul v. United States of America.....	1039
	Notes & Questions .....	1040
1.	The Impact of <i>Bahlul</i> .....	1040
2.	The Role of Defense Counsel .....	1041
3.	For Further Reading .....	1041
	Problem.....	1041
V.	Incitement in International Criminal Law .....	1043

VI. The Modern Law of Incitement.....	1045
Prosecutor v. Ferdinand Nahimana, Jean-Bosco Barayagwiza & Hassan Ngeze, Case No. ICTR-99-52-A, Judgement (Nov. 28, 2007).....	1046
Notes & Questions .....	1058
1. Case Outcome .....	1058
2. A Theory of Criminal Speech.....	1059
3. Elements of Incitement .....	1060
4. The Genocide Convention .....	1060
5. Incitement and Instigation .....	1061
6. Incitement and Persecution.....	1062
7. Incitement via Social Media .....	1062
8. Jurisdiction <i>Ratione Temporis</i> .....	1063
9. The Free Speech International Standard .....	1064
10. Georges Ruggiu.....	1064
11. Prevention .....	1065
12. A Threat to Free Speech and Democracy? .....	1066
13. Protection of Journalists .....	1067
14. For Further Reading .....	1067
Problem.....	1068
<b>Chapter 17. Defenses Under International Criminal Law .....</b>	<b>1073</b>
I. Introduction.....	1073
II. <i>Nullum Crimen Sine Lege</i> .....	1073
Prosecutor v. Sam Hinga Norman, Case No. SCSL-2004-14- AR72(E), Decision on Preliminary Motion Based on Lack of Jurisdiction (May 31, 2004) .....	1075
Prosecutor v. Sam Hinga Norman, Case No. SCSL-2004-14- AR72(E), Dissenting Opinion of Justice Geoffrey Robertson (May 31, 2004) .....	1083
Notes & Questions .....	1088
1. Case Outcome .....	1088
2. Sources of Law .....	1089
3. Customary International Law .....	1089
4. State Practice.....	1090
5. The Relativity of International Criminal Law .....	1090
6. Notice to Defendants.....	1091
7. Common Law Crimes .....	1091
8. Treaties as Sources of Law .....	1093
9. Human Rights Treaties .....	1093
10. The ICC Statute's Criminalization of Child Recruitment .....	1094
11. The Principle of Specificity .....	1094
12. <i>Lubanga</i> : A Reprise.....	1095
III. Superior Orders.....	1095
Notes & Questions .....	1098
1. The ICC Formulation .....	1098
2. Superior Orders .....	1098
3. Superior Orders and Duress.....	1098

Prosecutor v. Erdemović, Case No. IT-96-22-A, Joint Separate Opinion of Judge McDonald and Judge Vohrah (Oct. 7, 1997).....	1099
Prosecutor v. Erdemović, Case No. IT-96-22-A, Joint Separate Opinion of Judge Cassese (Oct. 7, 1997).....	1106
Notes & Questions .....	1108
1. Case Outcome .....	1108
2. A Clash of Titans.....	1108
3. Civil Law v. Common Law Approaches .....	1109
4. For Further Reading .....	1109
Problem.....	1109
IV. Necessity.....	1110
Judgment Concerning the Legality of the General Security Service's Interrogation Methods, 38 I.L.M 1471, 1474-84 (1999) .....	1111
Notes & Questions .....	1118
1. Necessity Defense.....	1118
2. Ticking Time Bombs .....	1118
3. Necessity and U.S. Interrogation Practices.....	1120
4. Professional Responsibility.....	1121
5. The ICC and Necessity .....	1121
V. Combat Immunity.....	1121
United States v. John Phillip Walker Lindh.....	1122
Notes & Questions .....	1129
1. Lindh's Confession .....	1129
2. The Plea .....	1129
3. Combat Immunity .....	1130
4. Duress or Necessity.....	1130
5. Prisoners of War and Citizenship .....	1131
6. Treason .....	1131
7. Sedition .....	1131
8. Defense Strategy .....	1132
9. For Further Reading .....	1133
VI. <i>Tu Quoque</i> & Reprisals.....	1133
Prosecutor v. Zoran Kupreškić, Case No. IT-96-12-T, Judgement (Jan. 14, 2000) .....	1134
Notes & Questions .....	1138
1. Case Outcome .....	1138
2. <i>Tu Quoque</i> .....	1138
3. The Doctrine of Reprisals .....	1138
4. Reprisals and Protected Persons and Objects .....	1139
5. Reciprocity in IHL.....	1140
6. <i>Dicta</i> and the Development of International Criminal Law.....	1140
VII. Head of State Immunity .....	1140
Prosecutor v. Omar Hassan Ahmad Al Bashir, Case No. ICC-02/ 05-01/09 OA2, Judgment in the Jordan Referral re Al Bashir Appeal (May 6, 2019) .....	1144

Notes & Questions .....	1157
1. Al Bashir Overthrown.....	1157
2. Customary International Law v. Security Council Referral .....	1158
3. Other Relevant Treaties .....	1158
4. Domestic Jurisprudence on Efforts to Arrest Al Bashir ....	1159
5. Referral to the Assembly of State Parties and the U.N. Security Council .....	1159
6. Personal v. Functional Immunities.....	1160
7. Heads of State in the Dock .....	1161
8. The African Union and Immunity for Government Officials .....	1162
9. Yerodia .....	1163
10. Diplomatic Immunity.....	1163
11. State Immunity .....	1164
12. Immunities Under International and Domestic Law .....	1164
VIII. Amnesty.....	1165
Prosecutor v. Kallon, Case No. SCSL–2004–15–R72(E), Decision on Challenge to Jurisdiction: Lomé Accord Amnesty (Mar. 13, 2004).....	1166
Notes & Questions .....	1173
1. Peace Agreements .....	1173
2. South Africa and Amnesty.....	1175
3. Inter-American Human Rights System and Amnesties ....	1175
4. Amnesty in Cambodia .....	1178
Case of Ieng Sary, Case No. 002/19–09–2007–ECCC/OCIJ (PTC03), Decision on Appeal against Provisional Detention Order of Ieng Sary, Pre-Trial Chamber (October 17, 2008) .....	1178
Notes & Questions .....	1181
1. Case Update.....	1181
2. Amnesties Before the ICC .....	1181
3. Amnesties in International Humanitarian Law .....	1181
4. For Further Reading .....	1182
<b>Chapter 18. Sentencing &amp; Reparations .....</b>	<b>1183</b>
I. Introduction.....	1183
II. A Hierarchy of Crimes? .....	1184
Prosecutor v. Erdemović, Case No. IT–96–22–A, Separate and Dissenting Opinion of Judge Li (Oct. 7, 1997) .....	1184
Notes & Questions .....	1188
1. A Hierarchy of Crimes .....	1188
2. Plea Bargaining in Comparative Perspective .....	1189
3. Plea Bargaining in International Criminal Law.....	1191
4. Kambanda.....	1191
5. Plea Bargaining at the ICC .....	1192
6. The Death Penalty .....	1192
III. The Term of Incarceration.....	1193
Prosecutor v. Erdemović, Case No. IT–96–22–T, Sentencing Judgement (March 5, 1998).....	1194

Prosecutor v. Plavšić, Case No. IT-00-39 & 40/1-T, Sentencing Judgement (Feb. 27, 2003) .....	1201
Notes & Questions .....	1212
1. Case Outcomes .....	1212
2. Principles of Sentencing and Sources of Law .....	1212
3. The Interests of the Victims .....	1213
4. Hierarchy and Sentencing .....	1213
5. Reconciliation and Justice .....	1214
6. Deterrence and Incentives.....	1214
7. Critiques and Further Reading.....	1214
IV. Reparations .....	1215
Prosecutor v. Thomas Lubanga Dyilo, Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, Decision on Sentence Pursuant to Article 76 of the Statute (July 10, 2012).....	1216
Notes & Questions .....	1217
1. Lubanga's Sentence and Imprisonment .....	1217
2. Dissent .....	1218
3. Sexual Violence Charges.....	1218
4. Child Soldiers .....	1218
5. The Lubanga Reparations Decisions .....	1219
Prosecutor v. Thomas Lubanga Dyilo, Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, Judgment on the Appeals against Trial Chamber II's 'Decision Setting the Size of the Reparations Award for which Thomas Lubanga Dyilo is Liable' (July 18, 2019) (Public Redacted).....	1220
Notes & Questions .....	1233
1. Lubanga's Liability for Reparations .....	1233
2. The ICC and Reparations .....	1233
3. The ICC Trust Fund for Victims .....	1234
4. Types of Reparations.....	1235
5. Gender and Reparations: Girl Soldiers.....	1235
6. Inter-American System and Reparations .....	1236
7. Reparations Before the ECCC.....	1236
<b>Appendix: Maps .....</b>	<b>1239</b>
INDEX .....	1253